### THESIS

# THE HISTORY AND DEVELOPMENT OF SPANISH-LANGUAGE INITIATIVES IN PUBLIC LIBRARIES: A CASE STUDY

# Submitted by

Adele Lonas

Department of English

Department of Languages, Literatures and Cultures

In partial fulfillment of the requirements

For the Degree of Master of Arts

Colorado State University

Fort Collins, Colorado

Fall 2018

## Master's Committee:

Advisors: Anthony Becker, English

Jonathan Carlyon, Languages, Literatures and Cultures

Silvia Soler Gallego Pamela Coke Copyright by Adele Lonas 2018

All Rights Reserved

#### **ABSTRACT**

# THE HISTORY AND DEVELOPMENT OF SPANISH-LANGUAGE INITIATIVES IN PUBLIC LIBRARIES: A CASE STUDY

The purpose of this case study is to examine how overall services, programs, resources and collections offered in Spanish have developed over the course of the past century at a single library district in Colorado. The study uses the Hispanic history and current demographics of the regional context as a foundation, as well research supporting both multilingualism and the role that libraries play in creating community cohesion in multicultural and multilingual communities to evaluate the findings. The findings, based on archival research and interviews, include a narrative of the development of the Spanish-language initiatives developed over the course of the past century, and a summary of the challenges and obstacles encountered by the interviewees. Five recommendations are made in response to ongoing challenges and obstacles, ranging from increased promotion of the library to Hispanic families and communities, to increased representation and inclusion of Hispanic community members at all administrative levels and on the library board.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to thank my advisor Anthony Becker, for his moral support, encouragement and guidance in developing the final focus of my thesis; and my advisor Jonathan Carlyon, for his encouragement and generosity with his time throughout the development of the background, which was the main inspiration for my thesis. I would also like to thank the individuals who very generously offered their time for the interviews and for creating such a detailed timeline of outreach's efforts at High Plains Library District, and likewise supplied me with additional supporting material and so enthusiastically shared their stories. In many ways, I look at this case study as a collective biography of your own efforts to create an inclusive community. Thank you also to Patricia Miller for her own show of persistence in the face of doubt, and for preventing me from derailing three years of work this last spring. And lastly, thank you to my mother for her own tireless encouragement, love and love of history and libraries that had everything to do with the focus of my thesis, and my persistence in wanting to complete it.

# **DEDICATION**

This thesis is dedicated to Lorena Gonzalez, Teresa Montalvo, Silvia and Leticia Perez, Lupe Ramirez and Jorge Juarez, and their families and extended family, for their love and friendship.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
DEDICATION	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	V
LIST OF TABLES	. vii
CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 2 - BACKGROUND	6
Bi- and Multilingualism in the U.S.	6
Mono- and Multilingual Views toward Language	9
Language Ideologies and Policies	12
Language Policies and Public Space	13
The Multilingual and Hispanic Heritage of Colorado	15
Early Labor Recruitment from Mexico in Colorado	17
Colorado's Hispanic Heritage	18
Recent Colorado Immigration and Labor	21
Legislation in Colorado: Amendment 281 and SB 17-123	24
Language and Public Libraries in Colorado	25
Public Library History	27
Public Libraries and Capital	29
Patron Rights and Standards for Services	31
Hispanics and Public Libraries in the U.S.	33

Public Libraries in Colorado	37
CHAPTER 3 – METHODOLOGY	43
Data Overview	43
Sources of Data	45
Interviews	46
Data Analysis	49
CHAPTER 4 – FINDINGS	51
Initiatives	51
Initial Efforts	51
Outreach 2001-2005	53
Outreach 2006-2009	57
Outreach 2010-2015	62
Ongoing, Recent and Current Efforts	64
Collections	68
Staff and Translations	72
Challenges and Obstacles	80
CHAPTER 5 – IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	85
CHAPTER 6 – CONCLUSION	96
REFERENCES	98
APPENDICES	116

# LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1- Phases and Steps of Data Analysis	47
·	
TABLE 2- Overview of Findings	120

#### CHAPTER 1 – INTRODUCTION

A year before the 2016 election primaries, GOP candidate Jeb Bush responded in Spanish to a question that had been asked in Spanish at a news conference in Florida. Donald Trump criticized Jeb Bush in an interview with Breitbart News for speaking Spanish, stating that "he should set an example by speaking English while in the United States" (Parker, 2015); he then wrote more explicitly in a Tweet, "'who cares that he speaks Mexican, this is America, English!!'" (Moreno, 2015). Bush questioned his fellow candidate's stance on bilingualism, stating that "the fact that he would say that you only can speak English is kind of ridiculous if you think about it. Are we going to close all the foreign language classes?" (Sullivan, 2015). The exchange, illustrative of the jabs lobbed during presidential campaigns, also illustrates that "language issues are always people issues" and are also always political (Iyengar, 2014, p. 57). While in this exchange the motive may have been to discredit an antagonist, it also clarified the relationship between language and territory by attempting to affirm linguistic ownership over a specified territory.

Despite some arguments downplaying the importance of knowing a second language, more than two-thirds of the world population is, at minimum, bilingual. For the same reason, countless countries have more than one official or national language; Norway, for example, has two, while Belgium has three (Central Intelligence Agency, 2018). The percentage of bilinguals and multilinguals worldwide fails to support any nationalistic tendency to equate one language with one state, nationhood or socio-political borders. Instead, the percentage illustrates the rich cultural and linguistic reality of the world.

Currently, approximately 6,909 distinct languages are spoken around the world; when grouped together by family, at least 300 of the more than 6,000 languages are spoken in the United States (U.S.) alone (Ryan, 2013). In larger metropolitan areas of the U.S. this equates to between 125 and more than 200 different languages being spoken by approximately 4 million to 20 million individuals; Spanish is spoken by approximately 39,145,066 (U.S. Census Bureau, "Number of Languages," 2015; U.S. Census Bureau, "5-year Estimates," 2016). However, because second and third languages spoken by individuals are only recorded by the census if the language is spoken within the home, what the census fails to appreciate is the number of individuals who may speak up to two, three or more languages fluently, be it at school, at work, in their social lives or business communications—in short, in public.

In Colorado, the 2006-2008 American Community Survey (ACS), identified 134 distinct languages spoken in the state, thirty-six of which were spoken by at minimum, 1,000 people (U.S. Census Bureau, "Detailed Languages," 2010). As of 2016, the overall number of people who speak a language other than English at home was approximately 851,800; and of those who do, 597,098 speak Spanish (U.S. Census Bureau, "ACS 1-year Estimates," 2016). The large number of people who speak Spanish at home in Colorado is illustrative of the state's large Hispanic population. Within the individual counties of Colorado, as of 2010, the Hispanic population ranged from 2.8% to 66%; in 16 counties, it was over 30%; and in 23 counties, it was at or above the state percentage of 20.7%. Nearly two-thirds of the counties in Colorado could claim a Hispanic population greater than 10% (U.S. Census Bureau, "Race and Hispanic or Latino," 2010). Of those counties, the number of people who speak Spanish at home ranges similarly; more than 50% in select areas of Weld County and up to 67% in Fort Garland, Costilla

<sup>-</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Notwithstanding, the U.S. Census undercounted Hispanics overall in 2010 by approximately 1.54%, and Hispanic children by approximately 400,000 (U.S. Census Bureau, "Undercount," 2012; Wire, 2016).

County (Statistical Atlas, "Weld County," 2015; "Costilla County," 2015). While the statistics reflect both the bilingual and bicultural wealth of the state, and the current presence that Latinos and the Spanish language maintain within the state's political boundaries, what they don't reflect is how historical this presence is—Colorado's heritage is in large part Hispanic.

In a state such as Colorado, the public library, as an interface between the public and private spheres, can be instrumental in promoting and normalizing bilingualism and biculturalism at the community level. Likewise, it can also be instrumental in promoting and maintaining cohesion within a bilingual and bicultural community. This is specifically because libraries are recognized both as "low-intensive meeting places" and as places where patrons can recognize and appreciate being "exposed to the plurality of the community in the library, and learn[...] about *otherness*" (Aabo & Audunson, 2012, p. 144-146). In Aabo and Audunson's (2012) study, "Use of Library Space and the Library as Place," patrons highlighted that exposure was one of the reasons they chose to study there: their interest was "[t]o study in an industrious atmosphere with people of different ages, ethnicities, backgrounds, and purposes...[because] recognizing otherness seem[ed] to be an integral part of [the public library] setting" (p. 144). Public spaces where this interactional dynamic occurs are often called a *third space*, defined by Aabo and Audunson as "a communal (parochial) arena with a low threshold" (p.141).

Although there are multiple interpretations of a *third space*, Edwards, Rauseo and Unger (2013) describe it as a public sphere for multicultural populations that builds and supports community cohesion. Elmborg (2011) similarly offers a definition that can be easily related to public libraries: a space that is representational of all members of the community and as a borderland in which identities are flexible and equally valued (p. 141). In light of these interpretations, such a space cannot have a "permanent privileged center" if it is to function as

fully representational and allow for agency to be realized and respected by and among all patrons (Elmborg, 2011, p. 344).

Taking into consideration Colorado's Hispanic heritage, it is important to understand what role public libraries have played in promoting and maintaining inclusive community cohesion. Likewise, in recognizing that many Hispanic communities in Colorado have been and still are concentrated in smaller cities and surrounding towns where there is little access to other community-oriented resources, it is important to evaluate how that role has developed over time. Understanding the history and development of the Spanish-language initiatives and where they are currently can clarify how fully representational and inclusive the library has been and is, and how successful it has been in normalizing Spanish. Likewise, understanding how the initiatives have developed can help identify if the challenges previously encountered in creating a fully representational space—a third space inclusive of Spanish—have been resolved or not. While on the one hand, a library has to resolve the challenges and obstacles to fully welcome, represent and serve Spanish-speaking families, and individuals, it is only in taking the step to do so—to be fully inclusive—that it will learn how to resolve them. Notwithstanding, it is only in taking the step to resolve the obstacles that it will succeed in promoting and maintaining inclusive community cohesion.

In aiming to understand the challenges and their possible solutions in developing

Spanish-language initiatives in public libraries, this present study focuses on one library district
in Colorado. This library was specifically chosen, as it serves a region whose Hispanic
population has been present for more than a century and is now both diverse and large. The goal
of this study is to create a template for other districts, not in relation to the specific
recommendations but rather in relation to the process of understanding the socio-cultural and

linguistic context within which they operate to be fully responsive to the same context. This present study looks at how and when the initiatives began in relation to the district's Hispanic heritage; if and when the initiatives became consistent and district-wide and what kinds of initiatives they encompassed; what challenges and obstacles have prevented their sustainability and reach; and, from a layman's perspective, what steps the library can take to represent the district fully in relation to its integral Hispanic heritage and current Hispanic community.

### CHAPTER 2 - BACKGROUND

## Bi- and Multilingualism in the U.S.

North America was multilingual long before Anglo-Saxon settlers arrived. In the year preceding 1607, 250 distinct languages were spoken on the continent among the Native American tribes. Sadly, this has been reduced to 169 and to approximately 372,000 users, according to Siebens and Julian (2011) in the 2011 American Community Survey Brief, "Native North American Languages Spoken at Home in the United States and in Puerto Rico: 2006-2010". Despite the loss of these languages, the fact that close to half of the names of states in the U.S. are from Native American languages is still testament of this important aspect of the continent's linguistic history (Sterbenz, 2014). In addition, the first Spanish expeditioners to traverse parts of the continent, and afterward the soldiers, priests and other figures who constituted the Spanish Empire represented different ethnicities and languages: African, Mexican and Indian, Italians, Germans, French, British, Irish, and others (Fell, 2013). Similarly, the first English-speaking settlers were inclusive of English, Scottish and Irish, representing multiple variations of the English language, just as the French settlers occupying the Louisiana Territory spoke French from the mainland, Canadian French, and the variations of Cajun French (Fell, 2013). North America provided a meeting ground for linguistic collaboration among the first expeditioners and colonizers in light of the common goals of survival, settlement and exploitation.

The founding fathers of the United States, on gaining independence from England and writing the U.S. constitution in 1787, saw establishing an official language as a hallmark of autocratic tyrannies and therefore important to avoid (de Jong, 2011). Likewise, as in the case of

Welsh, many immigrants saw coming to the U.S. as an opportunity to give their language a home and as a place for its "renaissance"; still others saw it as an opportunity to "extend [their language's] presence across the Atlantic" along with the national character that it was believed to embody, as in the case of vernacular German (Iyengar, 2014, p. 39). And while German's stronghold in Pennsylvania and other colonies concerned Benjamin Franklin that the Anglos were becoming a minority, even he finally concluded that supporting the German bilingual schools in exchange for their partisan support was of greater political benefit (Crawford, 2000).

Despite the rich multilingual beginnings of the U.S. and its initial efforts to preserve it, the role of language throughout the United States' history has also been conflicted. Since the nation's inception, political factions have historically used language as a mechanism to promote a specific population's identity, and "as a weapon" against multiple other populations to deny them of their identity—namely, Native Americans, African slaves and Hispanics (Mugane, 2005, p.160). Additionally, the groups that were initially encouraged to preserve their language were often subsequently demonized, as in the case of Germans during the first World War.

Like Franklin after his initial consternation, the first statesmen saw multilingualism among the European settlers as beneficial to the colonies; it embodied the spirit of settler-colonialism as well as supported the democratic ideals as they applied to Anglos and northern Europeans. As highlighted by Iyengar (2014), not only were the settlers permitted to maintain their language, but they were supported in doing so through the establishment of bilingual parochial and public schools in both rural and urban ethnic communities—enrollment in Cincinnati in German-English bilingual public schools peaked at 15,119 in 1875 (Iyengar, 2014, p. 46); by 1915, one in four children nationwide attended German-English bilingual public schools (Crawford, 2000).

While in Europe during the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries language was being inextricably linked to concepts of nationhood, blood, character and land in an effort to promote national pride, during the settlement of the U.S., the relationship between language and national identity was of a different and variable nature. As highlighted above, for some, the U.S. was viewed as a place for linguistic freedom, at least until 'extra-lingual' political concerns, namely the first World War and the 1920's labor movements, would lead to an emphasis on Anglicization as the remedy for civil unrest (Crawford, 2000). In contrast, other populations were steadfastly denied the right to bilingual education, isolated within their use of their mother tongue or outrightly divested of their language.

The most dismaying examples of the contradictory language policies are those concerning Native American boarding schools and public schools in Puerto Rico. Adams (1995) references Carl Schurz, who was Secretary of the Indian Affairs from 1877 to 1881, as having estimated that "it cost nearly a million dollars to kill an Indian in warfare, whereas it cost only \$1,200 to give an Indian child eight years of schooling" (Adams, 1995, p.20). This view toward Native Americans led to the establishment of off-reservation boarding schools, and to Schurz's own ultimatum of "extermination or civilization" (Adams, 1995, p.15). The founder of the first boarding school, Capt. Richard H. Pratt, coined the phrase, "kill the Indian, and save the man"; however, the underlying ideology—that of viewing education as a more economical alternative to war—was also what motivated imposing English-only public education in Puerto Rico. As stated by the education administrator in 1902 following the acquisition of Puerto Rico as a colony, "Colonization carried forward by the armies of war is vastly more costly than that carried forward by the armies of peace, whose outposts and garrisons are the public schools of the advancing nation" (as cited by Crawford, 2000, p. 17).

While the English-only public schools in Puerto Rico failed and were discontinued in 1948, the Native American boarding schools were later deemed as the most effective way to eliminate the indigenous languages and all that settlers interpreted them to embody. The schools were only dismantled in the latter half of the 20th century, with the exception of one that still operates in Riverside, California (Bear, 2008: Iyengar, 2014).

As illustrated by U.S. history and current politics in the U.S., "language issues are always people issues" (Iyengar, 2014, p. 57). In the case of both Puerto Rico and Native Americans, it was not the language itself that was the issue at hand but the "savages and senile peoples" that the languages represented and even more specifically, the coveted space they occupied (as cited in Crawford, 2000, p. 17). For the same reason, attempts to eliminate the language are viewed as preliminary to ownership of the coveted space, and subsequent acquiescence of the existing populations. Consequently, when Mugane (2005) states that the "confinement of languages in people's minds is the initial step in erasing them," the inverse becomes self-evident: the promotion and extension of languages to physical and socio-political spaces beyond the mind is the initial step in both affirming and valuing not just the language, but also the people, history and culture that it embodies (p.151).

## Mono- and Multilingual Views toward Language

To understand what multilingualism is and the underlying reasons for its politicization, it is important to understand the underlying component, language. Language can be thought of as a general interactional and dynamic process, in relation to any form of communication in action, or it can be thought of as a static system—a specific fixed system that has been categorized over time to fit the inherent parameters of its identifier, such as 'Spanish,' 'German,' 'Chinese,' 'Hmong,' etc. However, this interpretation of language, though common, is problematic since it

earmarks each system to express discrete characteristics that fit within specified parameters, and for those parameters to be accepted as 'closed' (Zabrodskaja, 2015). Similarly, language can be viewed as existing autonomously or as usage-based, an interaction between the users and the situations in which it is used (Ortega, 2014, p. 40).

When viewing language as a fixed system, the languages that are part of a common family will likely only be thought of as closed systems—meaning, that "every speech event [is deemed to] belong to a definite language" (Zabrodskaja, 2015, p. 497), and exists as an objective and fixed part of that language. Likewise, code-switching between two languages within this camp is usually interpreted as repeatedly jumping the parameters between one language and another, just as one might jump a 'a big, beautiful wall' between nations.

Related to this view of language as a fixed system is the view in the U.S. that monolingualism, despite being the norm for only 30% of the world's population, is the "natural form of knowing, doing and learning language" (Ortega, 2014, p. 35). However, the smaller percentage of monolingual people worldwide directly contradicts the rationale of promoting it as the norm; the contradiction clarifies that "[t]he motivations for wanting monolingualism to be 'normal' are many and deeply rooted in socio-political movements such as nationalism and globalism" (Rothman, 2008, p.442). In the U.S., the adoption of a monolingual perspective marks the socio-political change specific to the 19th and 20th centuries.

As mentioned above, from a monolingual perspective bi- and multilinguals are more frequently viewed as being in a perpetual deficit mode in relation to English. A monolingual understanding of English is set as the standard for measuring the outcomes of English- language learning in bilingual education programs; and bi- and multilingual students' English usage is measured as substandard against a monolingual understanding of English usage. The outcomes

are then used to debunk and defund bilingual public education programs as ineffective (Ortega, 2014).

Not surprisingly, viewing language as an entity with set parameters has purely sociopolitical roots: our general understanding of language is anchored to the concepts of political and
geographic spaces, and to whom those spaces belong. This contradicts the reality of the constant
human migrations across the spaces and geographies that have shaped human history. In terms of
language, this would imply that languages in use, just like human migrations, are much more
permeable and in a constant state of contact and metamorphosis than we conceive them to be.

However, in societies in which distinct but often convoluted parameters, such as race or
ethnicity, are consistently used to identify one or another population, language becomes
instrumental. Not only will specified languages be shunned, but also accents, as a way to shun
the ethnic, class, racial or cultural differences. As highlighted by Collins and Slembrouck (2005),
"the social classifications from which we speak presuppose spatial as well as social
classification" (p. 191); and that presupposes a [linguistic] system that is as non-negotiable as a
political border between school zones, voting districts and nations (Zabrodskaja, 2015).

Similarly, one example of a classification of language is that of a standard form. Just as a standard form of a language presupposes a standard social classification, it also presupposes the existence of a standard form of being—a standard "series of social practices and actions...embedded in a web of social relations" (Zabrodskaja, 2015, p. 496). The standard set for the language becomes that of the culture, ethnicity and class that the language is deemed to embody by native speakers and against which all the language's variations will be measured (Ortega, 2014). Seeing a language as emblematic of the qualities that a nation might pride itself on was clearly illustrated during the colonization of Puerto Rico, in determining that "English"

[was] the chief source, practically the only source, of democratic ideas" (as cited in Crawford, 2000, p. 17). Nonetheless, since even after gaining proficiency in English accent bias still leads to discrimination against immigrants, it becomes a point of contention as to at what point immigrants are given access to the space and society that English emblemizes.

Language ideologies and policies. In establishing a standard form of the language, a sense of ownership is then transferred to the spaces where it is determined it is or should be spoken and embodied. Despite the frequent attempts to promote a standard form of a language, the 'standard' not only "can be redefined and renegotiated" as highlighted by Zabrodskaja (2015) but it is in constant metamorphosis due to the simple fact that we use it interactively (p.494). Consequently, not only do bi- and multilingualism defy standardization, but the 'standard' monolingual form of a language in use also defies its own parameters.

As intimated above, much of the general view toward language is based on language ideologies—ideas about language that have "extended their presence" (Iyengar, 2014, p. 39) and been adopted or imposed as self-evident truths; the same ideologies are used as the basis for federal and state language policies. They additionally adhere to the socially entrenched opinions that "prejudge which language[s] in which forms are relevant for the tasks at hand...[of] what categories of persons speak which languages...[and] what communities they stand for, what kinds of competencies 'non-natives' are likely to have and what 'problems' they pose for a normatively monolingual speaker" (Collins & Slembrouck, 2005, p.192). For the same reason, it becomes clear that language policies are the attempt to maintain privilege within power, race, ethnic and class dynamics "[...] and not by concerns regarding language use per se" (M. G. S., 2001).

Language policies and public space. Unfortunately, these same entrenched opinions, in becoming the basis for language policies and our general understanding of language and languages, lead to anti-bilingual laws and attempts to displace undervalued languages from public spaces. The goal becomes to "confine them to people's minds," lest hearing them will challenge a person's sense of ownership over the particular space where they were heard (Iyengar, 2014, p. 55). There are countless cases that illustrate this sense of spatial ownership in relation to language. In one, a woman who was ordering a meal in Spanish at an IHOP was subsequently told to "learn English or get out of America" by another patron (Moreno, "Harmful Myths," 2015); the patron's expectation reiterated Sarah Palin's own response to Jeb Bush's bilingualism, that "in the United States we need to 'speak American'" (McWhorter, 2015).

In a second, a couple wrote to a U.S. born Latina waitress on their receipt at a restaurant that they "only tip citizens" (Moye, 2016). In a third, two men from India, working as engineers in Kansas, were shot and killed by an older man at a bar. The older man, just as the woman at IHOP, told the two engineers before shooting them to "Get out of my country!" (Schmidt, 2017, n.p.). As one reader wrote, quoting Theodore Roosevelt, in response to an op-ed on Sarah Palin's statement, "'We have room for but one flag, the American flag... We have room for but one language here, and that is the English language..." (TomManasota, 2015). As is evident, our understanding and use of language is determined by the ideologies and social classifications we adopt to define it, and that color our understanding over space and lead to claims of personal ownership of the approximately 3,718,710 square miles of land comprising the U.S.

As is illustrated by the IHOP patron, using Spanish, rather than representing a choice, denoted not knowing English and therefore, not belonging in the U.S. The patron's attitude toward Spanish evidences that attitudes toward bilingualism and multilingualism are equally

determined by socio-political factors. As Blommaert, Collins and Slembrouck (2005) state, "[bi-and] multilingualism is not what individuals have and don't have, but what the environment, as structured determinations and interactional emergence, enables or disables" (p. 197). These interactional determinations are illustrated in the recent legislation, SB 17-123², passed in Colorado; SB 17-123 recognizes bilingual and bi-literate graduating high school students with a Seal of Bi-literacy on their High School diploma.

Despite the recent pro-bilingual legislation in Colorado, in general, monolingual initiatives in the last decades have been typically promoted based on the myth of a historically monolingual nation where all success of past immigrants was gained by forsaking their mother tongue and culture. This view that the economic success of immigrants and their children hinges on the English language and monolingualism has entrenched itself within specific political factions; any bilingual initiatives for recent immigrants are promoted as instrumental, temporary and "remedial" in scaffolding learning English proficiently and assimilating individuals into the dominant public sphere of English (de Jong, 2011). However, as stated before, the insistence on establishing language policies based on "extra-lingual" concerns is of no benefit to the present or future of a historically multilingual nation where not just two or three languages are now spoken, but 300. It also contrasts sharply with an Oxford linguist's claim that presently, "bilingualism and multilingualism 'are a normal and unremarkable necessity of everyday life for the majority of the world's population" (as cited in Erard, 2012, para. 8).

The most important distinction to make about bi- and multilingualism is that speaking or learning English as a second or third language does not imply sacrificing the first language, but

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A bi-partisan bill, SB 17-123, passed on March 30, 2017, in response to a report on Colorado's economy released by Partnership for a New American Economy, is an endorsement recognizing student demonstration of bi-literacy based on GPA and World Language Advanced Placement test scores. Read the complete legislative act: https://leg.colorado.gov/sites/default/files/documents/2017A/bills/2017A 123 signed.pdf

rather implies choice—of choosing which language is the most "relevant [language] for the tasks at hand" (Collins & Slembrouck, 2005, p. 192). Additionally, bilingualism is not equivalent to the sum of two distinct monolingual languages but is rather a qualitative and quantitative cognitive state distinct from monolingualism, and in some cases, an act of "operating at the interface between several languages" (Anguori, 2013, p. 566). For the same reason, recognizing multilingualism as an inherent quality of U.S. society requires challenging the politics of space within each community to look at shared spaces as the "interface between several languages [and cultures]" as opposed to belonging to one dominant language (Angouri, 2013, p. 566). The aspect of bi- and multilingualism that this present paper hinges on is just that: a space that functions as an 'interface' among multiple languages and cultures within U.S. society, and more specifically, within the state of Colorado.

# The Multilingual and Hispanic Heritage of Colorado

Colorado's history, rooted in the history of multiple Native American Tribes, the early Spanish-American and Mexican settlers, and a mix of European, Asian and Mexican early immigrants, illustrates the rich multi-cultural and multi-lingual history of the U.S. The most significant example is highlighted in Fell's (2013), "Ever More Diversity: Race, Ethnicity and Immigration in Colorado." Fell (2013) highlights that the official debates over the state constitution were multilingual, occurring in English, German, and Spanish. The "perpetual senator of Colorado," Casimiro Barela, was a key proponent in ensuring multilingual debates on the constitution (Burrola, 1975, p. 34). Barela was the principal advocate for recognizing the newly formed state's multi-ethnic and linguistic reality, and of successfully campaigning for the publication of all state laws in English, Spanish and German. Article XVIII, Section 8, of the

Proceedings of the Constitution Convention illustrates the beneficial impact of Barela's progressive politics:

The General Assembly shall be provided for the publication of the laws passed at each session thereof; and until the year 1900 they shall cause to be published in Spanish and German a sufficient number of copies of said laws to supply that portion of the inhabitants of the state who speak those languages and who may be unable to read and understand the English language. (as cited in Burrola, 1975, p. 36)

This service to the public illustrates a keen awareness by Barela of the value of recognizing and responding to the multilingual community of the state and residents.

In addition to being a state legislator from 1869 to 1916, Barela was also a Chicano activist, both before and after Colorado was recognized as a state. In addition to publishing Spanish language newspapers, he supported the region's Spanish-American heritage and midcentury settlers from Mexico by pushing for bilingual education in southwest Colorado as early as the late 1800's and by advocating for the Mexican land grant recipients' rights as stated in the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo of 1848. As quoted from Barela (1975):

Al tratarse de mi raza/ especialmente si se trata de discriminar/ abdico de mis deseos políticos y me dedico a su defensa en todo tiempo y todo lugar. [If it has to do with my race/ especially if it has to do with discrimination/ I will denounce my political ambitions and dedicate myself to defending my race for all time and everywhere] (p.33).

At the time of the debates over the state's constitution, the state's multilingual and multicultural dynamic included fourteen different nationalities, leading the state to surpass the national percentage of foreign-born residents from the 1870's until 1910 (Goodykoontz, 1948). While taking into consideration that early immigration and census statistics were not fully reliable due to "inconsistent enumeration techniques" that continued until the last decade (Gutierrez, n.d.), in 1870 there were 14 different ethnicities identified by the U.S. Census Bureau. There were close to 8,800 immigrants from England, more than 8,000 from Ireland, 5,000 from Canada and 2,000 from Sweden (Goodykuntz, 1948, p. 80). By 1880, German

immigrants numbered close to 7,000; and because Colorado's boundaries were drawn to encompass much of the San Luis Valley, the Southern portion of the state was in effect predominantly Spanish-speaking, enough so for Spanish-language newspapers to already be in circulation in some towns as early as the mid 1870's (Goodykuntz, 1948, p.80, 98).

Overall, the total number of immigrants in Colorado between 1880 and 1910 increased from 38,633 to 115,335 (Goodykuntz 1948, p. 79). By 1910, the number of German immigrants in Colorado increased to more than 16,900, until the number of immigrants from Russia outnumbered the Germans in 1920 (p. 83). Most of the immigrants who came to Colorado (be it from Mexico, Germany, Russia or any other country) came to work in the sugar beet industry or other agricultural work, and in the Limestone quarries, coal mines and on the railroad, all of which the beet sugar industry depended on. After the sugar beet industry took hold of Colorado in the early 1900's and the GWSC had bought out most other sugar beet companies, "whole villages of people were transported" from Russia until the first laborers tried to unionize and were subsequently replaced by Japanese migrant workers and following, by Mexican-American and Mexican laborers (Fort Collins History Connection, 1996-2012; Hosokawa, 2005<sup>3</sup>).

Early labor recruitment from Mexico in Colorado. While the Immigration Acts of 1907 and 1917 imposed restrictions on immigration, during the first World War an official guest worker program was implemented specifically exempting workers from Mexico to allow for their active recruitment (Rosenblum, Kandel, Seelke, & Wassem, 2012). This exemption, along with the surge of industry and agriculture in the U.S. and the outbreak of the Mexican Revolution, led to a nationwide increase in the number of people who immigrated from Mexico

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Maeda (2008) highlights that "an estimated 3,000 Japanese Americans worked the fields of Colorado…making up one-sixth of the sugar beet workforce" by 1909 (n.p.); Hosokawa (2005) clarifies that many were likely used as strike-breakers.

between 1910 and 1920, from 220,000 to 478,000 (Gutierrez, n.d.). For Colorado, of the Mexicans and Mexican-Americans who were counted by the census, this led to an increase from 2,543 in 1910, to 10,894 in 1920 (Goodykuntz,1948, p. 81). Despite that the guest worker program was terminated in 1921, the exemptions specific to laborers from Mexico allowed for their continued recruitment; in 1920, the GWSC recruited up to 13,000 laborers from Mexico and the Southwest (Donato, 2007, p.33). At this point, the sugar beet companies had begun offering opportunities of more permanent housing and using silent films illustrating scenes of beet cultivation techniques, local parades and baseball games, and of families with cars and adobe homes, to attract potential laborers (GWSC, 1924).

Colorado's Hispanic heritage. While the number of immigrants arriving to Colorado from Mexico failed to rival the number from Germany and Russia in the early 1900's, the state map is evidence of the historical Spanish-American and Mexican presence both before and after state lines were drawn. Currently, there are approximately 150 place names of Spanish origin; some place names in English are translations from their original Spanish name. An example of this is 'Greenhorn,' a name referring to a creek, a valley, a mountain range, a mountain peak and a wilderness; and a newspaper, local businesses in the Greenhorn region, campgrounds, and a highway now renamed the Disabled Veterans Memorial Highway. The term 'Greenhorn' is taken from the name of a Comanche chief, Chief 'Cuerno Verde,' for the fearlessness he demonstrated at an early age within his tribe against the Spanish settlements in what is now northern New Mexico and southern Colorado (Taylor, 1976). Although the Spanish-Americans won out against him, his name lived on among the Spanish expeditioners and settlers; in Colorado history, geography, and local businesses; and in the English language, meaning 'inexperienced'.

Children: El Alma de la Raza Curriculum and Teacher Training Project for children in Colorado schools, highlights that Colorado historians too often overlook the Hispanic history that is foundational for understanding the settlement of Colorado. A key example of this oversight is in the Colorado Library Association Bulletin from January 1953. Reynolds (1953), in writing about the multicultural history of the state to counter the "insidious aggression" against diversity, succinctly failed to identify the predominantly Spanish-American and Mexican presence and influence; he opted instead to limit its ethnic heritage to "the German, the French, the Scandinavian, the Indians...[and] the Orientals" (pp.3-7).

Regardless of Reynolds' omission, the Southwest, inclusive of what is now Colorado, was the space of expeditions by Spanish explorers dating back to the 1500's, and of mining, farming and sheepherding in the 1700's to 1800's by Spanish-Americans and Mexicans—

Spanish-Americans were the first to bring sheep into the region. In 1846, following the purchase of the Territory of New Mexico, the U.S. government offered land grants to the Territory's original inhabitants who had previously been citizens of Mexico. The land grants offered full citizenship to the residents and theoretical protection of their property rights, if they chose to remain in their communities (Library of Congress, 2003). While the state lines were drawn in 1870 to draw the border between Colorado and New Mexico, it wasn't until 1876 that the state of Colorado was formed and the state constitution written.

However, the region's Hispanic heritage prior to state formation is as fundamental to its foundation and development as its Hispanic history after state formation. As quoted from Rogers (1976), in *Hispanic Colorado*, "A people that take no pride in the noble achievements of remote ancestors will never achieve anything worthy to be remembered with pride by remote descendants" (p.28). The Spanish origin of 150 place names in Colorado, including seventeen

county names, is worth remembering, as is the origin of places with stories and meaning for the German, Russian, Irish, Slavic, Japanese and multiple other immigrants, both past and present, who comprise the state's cultural and linguistic history and future.

Recent Colorado immigration and labor. The consistent increase in Colorado of biand multilingual households reflects both the state's multicultural past and present and the global multilingual reality. As highlighted in the introduction, approximately 11.9% speak Spanish at home in Colorado (U.S. Census Bureau, "ACS 1-year Estimates," 2016). In Colorado counties such as Costilla County, based on the 2011-2015 ACS 5-year estimates, 47.7% percent of the population speaks Spanish at home (Statistical Atlas, "Costilla County," 2015). In Weld County, while overall, approximately 16.5% speak Spanish, the Hispanic population is approximately 30% of the total (Statistical Atlas, "Weld County," 2015; U.S. Census Bureau, "Quick Facts: Weld County," 2016).

In areas of rural Colorado with a significant Hispanic population, agriculture, agriculture-related industries and farming are often the economic mainstay of the county. Based on the 2012 U.S. Census of Agriculture, there are approximately 38,019 farmworkers, and 3,774 workers in Horticultural, Greenhouse, Nursery and other related industries in Colorado (U.S. Department of Agriculture, 2014). Much of the Hispanic population in counties such as Costilla and Weld County works in agriculture or agriculture-related industries. While Costilla County does not have a significant "market value of agricultural products sold," Weld County's total value as of 2012 of agricultural products sold was \$1.86 billion (Rural Policy Research Institute [RUPRI], 2006, p.13; Staff Report, 2014). Despite the greater market value of Weld County's agricultural production, the poverty rate for children remained at approximately 18.7% and

overall at 11.5%; Costilla County's poverty rate is 30.4%—the median income was \$26,610 (Romano, 2014; U.S. Census Bureau, "Quick Facts," 2016).

Because of the high poverty rate in rural counties in general, libraries serving such areas have become more important; as highlighted in "The State of Small and Rural Libraries in the U.S.," their use has increased despite fiscal cutbacks (Swan, Grimes & Owens, 2013). Libraries are relevant in these areas because of the services, programs and access to technology and other resources that they may offer to communities that have few resources. Likewise, they are relevant because of what they can offer to meet the multilingual and multicultural needs of the migrant, immigrant and refugee populations that Colorado's agricultural industries depend on.

Despite the predominance of agriculture and agriculture-related industries in Colorado, surveys of the state's farm and horticultural workers, their demographics, access to educational programs, social and health services are not conducted in the state. Notwithstanding, it is a safe assumption that the nationwide demographics highlighting the percentage of workers who identify as Hispanic and predominantly Spanish-speaking are applicable at the state level. In 2016, there were 135,000 H-2A recipients nationwide within a span of nine months for farm jobs (UC Davis, "H-2A, H-2B," 2016); this is in addition to the approximate 1,736,821 of both seasonal and migrant laborers on farms. The National Center for Farmworker Health, Inc. (2009) reported approximately 80% of migrant and seasonal farmworkers identified both as Hispanic and predominantly Spanish-speaking. This approximate percentage has remained constant over the past fifteen years when compared to the NAWS five-year estimates (UC Davis, "H-2A, H-2B," 2016). Based on the NAWS five-year estimates for 2013-2014, Spanish is the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Taken from the 2012 Census of Agriculture, this number is inclusive of workers employed "less than 150 days". When inclusive of those employed more than 150 days, hired farm labor based on the 2012 Census is 2,736,417. However, the Department of Labor states that the data collected on hired farmworkers through the NAWS excludes H-2A recipients. For confirmation, see https://www.doleta.gov/naws/pages/overview/data-limitations.cfm.

only language spoken by approximately 74%. And whereas 31% speak "a little" English, only 11% speak "some" English (U.S. Department of Labor, 2016, p.12).

The nationwide undercount of Hispanics by the U.S. Census Bureau is historical; the Bureau did not establish a policy to collect data systematically on Hispanic origin until after the 1997 Revisions to the Standards for the Classification of Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity (Pew Research Center, 2012); and it was only in 2010 that, according to Cohn (2010), the questions were revised adequately enough to lead "more U.S. natives to identify as Hispanic than had been the case in earlier years" (n.p.). Notwithstanding, Colorado depends on immigrant labor in many "low-visibility" sectors—on dairy farms and cattle ranches and in sheepherding; in landscaping and horticulture; and on agricultural farms producing a full range of crops such as spinach, onions, carrots, cantaloupe, pears, apples, cherries and peaches. Failing to recognize the workers' presence puts the state at risk of inadequate funding for the programs, services and schools that serve the same workers, their families and children.

Additionally, the undercount of minority groups affects democratic processes of fair political representation and participation in communities by "skew[ing] the demographic and socioeconomic profile of all communities" (Kissam, 2016, p.3). An undercount of any ethnic, racial, linguistic or gendered population, risks unfair representation at both the state and federal level through the loss of congressional seats, and the loss of funding for needed government, social, community, employment and educational services that help maintain the state economy. A debate introduced by Representative Ted Poe (R-TX-2) in 2015 as H.R. 2255 and supported as a partisan bill (Congress.gov, 2015) to make the ACS—the source for much of the language data in this present study—voluntary beyond basic personal information puts at even further risk funding for bi- and multi-lingual programs, services and resources, inclusive of those offered by

public libraries. Similarly, the threat of including a citizenship question on the 2020 census also puts funding for states and any immigrant-related services at risk.

The significance of Colorado's Hispanic and Spanish-speaking population throughout its history is multi-faceted. It clarifies the historically integral role Hispanics have maintained in the state's economy and cultural and social web; it clarifies their continued presence and economic, social and cultural contributions to Colorado; and it creates an anchor for the state to identify with the perspective that global bi- and multilingualism is "a normal and unremarkable necessity of everyday life for the majority of the world's population" (as cited in Erard, 2012, para. 8). For the same reason, it provides districts in the state with an opportunity to fully develop their libraries as a multilingual and multicultural public interface and as a crux of the state's social capital.

Legislation in Colorado: Amendment 281 and SB 17-123. In contrast to SB 17-123, Colorado's Seal of Biliteracy, English-only movements have pervaded politics and education in Colorado in the past just as in other states. Although English-only legislation has been directed more specifically at the bilingual Spanish-English programs in public schools, it has also been aimed at bilingual collections, resources and services offered by public libraries and other public institutions. In 2002, Californian Ron Unz managed to present an anti-bilingual initiative, Amendment 31, for popular vote; the initiative was proposed as a constitutional amendment. Unz, a businessman and former conservative candidate for the seat of governor in California, funded English-only campaigns not just in Colorado, but also in California, Arizona and Massachusetts where the amendments passed.

While it was not the first English-only initiative, Unz's contrasted with the prior English-only initiative of 2000, "English for the Children," campaigned by Linda Chavez, and sponsored

by Joe Chavez, Charles King and Tom Tancredo (Escamilla, Shannon, Carlos & Garcia, 2003). The former proposition was characterized by opponents as "anti-immigrant" and "anti-Latino" (Escamilla et al, 2003), but Unz's proposed Amendment focused the rhetoric on children's linguistic rights to learn English, based on the idea that bilingual education denied children of their rights. While Amendment 31 was defeated, the rhetoric of the initiative illustrates the common argument that proficiency in English is the key to success for all immigrants; and inversely, that bilingualism is the obstacle to proficiency in English, and therefore the obstacle to assimilation into U.S. society and success. The fact that Colorado was the only state to defeat Unz's proposed amendment at the time, designates a role for the state in recognizing and valuing multilingualism.<sup>5</sup> Fortunately, this role has been embraced by the bipartisan state bill mentioned earlier, SB 17-123.

Language and public libraries in Colorado. While the proposed English-only legislation may have lost in Colorado, the underlying anti-immigrant sentiment and view of bilingualism as a threat to the power that the dominant language embodies continued. The argument was extended to the use of tax dollars to purchase material in Spanish for public libraries; that "[...] taxpayer money should not be spent on a population that can include [undocumented] immigrants" (Associated Press, 2005). But as a librarian from the Pueblo District library clarified, the services, collections and resources a library provides should reflect the needs and languages of the surrounding community "whether that be in English or Spanish or another language" (Associated Press, 2005). In recognizing the linguistic needs of its individual

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> California voted on and passed Proposition 58 in 2016, to repeal Proposition 227, Unz's English-only Amendment in CA. Proposition 58, Non-English Languages Allowed in Public Education, allows bilingual education programs to now be implemented.

patrons, the library also helps set the precedent for valuing multilingualism within the public sphere, as well as the precedent for promoting and maintaining inclusive community cohesion.

As a public institution dependent on government funding, it's important to consider how the English-only education initiative affects public libraries, as well as how public libraries can counter such initiatives. In 2005, the Colorado Alliance for Immigration Reform (CAIRCO), Coalition for a Closer Look and the Colorado Minutemen Project and Sovereignty, challenged that the presence of Spanish language material in the Denver Public Library was an exiling of English. CAIRCO more specifically claimed that "[Spanish-language] novellas ha[d] been brought into Denver Public Libraries, presumably at taxpayer expense, to replace English language books" and that "[t]he DPL [was] trying to find a way to give illegal aliens access to the library [...that] Employees were verbally told to accept Mexican drivers' licenses" (CAIRCO, 2005, n.p.). CAIRCO's stance illustrates both the misconception of the linguistic heritage of the U.S., as well as resistance to plural, multilingual and multicultural public spaces—in other words, community. This resistance is further illustrated by their insistence that .... "written information [...] should be provided largely, say 95 percent, in the native language of our country, which is English" (as cited in CAIRCO, 2005, n.p.).

Just as the Pueblo District Library clarified their duty to attend to community needs, the DPL responded to CAIRCO that "the Library's doors are open to all [...] The Denver Public Library is not an immigrations enforcement agency" (Denver Public Library, n.d.). The DPL declared itself to be obligated to the communities it serves—and equally disinterested in the legal status of its patrons.

### **Public Library History**

At its inception in the U.S. in the mid- 1800's, the public library was promoted as a "popular library" and principally put forth as a place that was "adapted to the wants of the whole people and not in the meaning of containing books of merely ephemeral interest..." (Green, 1913, p. 6). The library itself was to offer books to be used for free by the community, though at the expense of the community, for the purpose of promoting a cultural standard. In many ways, the "popular library," as it was being promoted, was a place for books, for self-education, and promoting cultural and intellectual self-realization. It can be understood to support the idea of the 'American Dream', and of success as wholly dependent on self-initiative: go to the library; and read. In 1890, Thomas Greenwood published in *Public Libraries* a list highlighting the reasons why every municipality in England should have a public library; the first reason stated is that the library is to "mental and moral health" what sanitation is to physical health (as cited in Lamb, 2012-2016, n.p.). Other reasons include free access to literature by everyone and emphasis on the library as an educational institution, and as a multi-purpose meeting and recreational place, for the general public.

However, this push for the self-realization of the masses can be interpreted through opposing perspectives which are evident in Greenwood's 1890 list. In addition to the emphasis on free access to literature and a generalized public meeting and reading space, Greenwood also emphasizes the need to educate laborers to stay abreast of trends in other parts of Europe and the U.S., and to reduce petty crimes; in the same light, Greenwood saw the public library as emblematic of the "standard of intelligence and public spirit manifested in that town" (as cited in Lamb, 2012-2016, n.p.). While these reasons are specific to England, they are reiterated in Goldstein's (2003) overview of both early public libraries in Iowa and professional training for

librarians as a solution to "a pressing local problem" (p. 215)—as clarified in the title, "The Spirit of an Age: Iowa Public Libraries and Professional Librarians as Solutions to [S]ociety's Problems". The problems and the solution alluded to are stated more specifically in Harris' (1972) revisionist history of the public library: not only was it a way to attract "the 'middling classes" from the streets and to prevent "railroad rioters" and union strikes, but also to ensure "the gradual deliverance of the people from the wiles of the rhetorician and stump orator, with their distorted fancies and one-sided collection of the facts" (as cited by Harris, 1972, pp. 21-23).

With the influx of immigrants in the early 1900's, there were conflicting ideas about what the public library's purpose was among immigrant populations: whether it was an instrument of assimilation, one of cultural essentialism or, as in the case of the New York Public Library (NYPL) and its defense of its ample foreign language collection, a human right of the foreignborn population. Whereas many libraries saw immigrants as one of the "problem groups" and "lost souls" needing education, life skills and to be integrated into civilized society (as cited in Lamb, 2012-2016); Dain (2000) cites a spokesperson for the NYPL who in contrast declared it as "cruel to deny reading matter to people too old or too exhausted by their labor to learn English... 'it was of the greatest importance...that the library should in every way show respect for the opinions, customs and religions of [the immigrants] whom American life treats cruelly" (p.67); the spokesperson clarified that "the right book in any language would introduce [immigrants] to American life and ideals" (p.67). For the same reason, many urban public libraries did begin to develop foreign language collections in the early 1900's. This led to the formation of the American Library Association's (ALA) Committee on Work with Foreign Born in 1917, and after, to a survey being conducted by the ALA of public libraries' foreign language collections, which included, in order of the size of the collections at the fifty libraries who responded,

French, German, Italian, Yiddish, Spanish, Polish, Czech and Russian (Bezugloff, 1980). When a similar survey was conducted in 1979, ten of the responding libraries stated they had begun their collections prior to 1900, and thirteen prior to World War I (Bezgugloff, 1980).

The multilingual collections highlight some libraries' awareness that multilingualism was a reality of immigration, and that, as Campbell (1980) also reiterated decades later, "no library service in the world can afford to neglect the fact of language" (Campbell, 1980, p. 210).

Campbell (1980), as Director of the Toronto Public Library reflected on the public library's own need to respond to those of immigrants:

[i]n some cases, the service may resist changing established practices for some time. In the end, however, the different needs become apparent; and although they "don't pay it no mind" in terms of surface differences, only at their peril can libraries neglect the fundamental requirements which the immigrant member of each society presents for consideration. (p. 214)

Public libraries and capital. The contemporary understanding of the public library as a space for educational, cultural, creative and civic engagement is evidence of the ways in which libraries have increased their value for the individuals and the communities they serve; they do, in effect, 'make cities stronger' as the Urban Libraries Council (2007) states. While Jaeger, Bertot, Kodama, Katz and DeCoster (2011) recognize that there are multiple ways to interpret value that also apply to understanding how the public library benefits local economies, they clarify that understanding this benefit is mostly evidenced in feedback on surveys of patrons. For example, in a survey carried out in 2005 that Jaeger et al. (2011) cite, more than 90% of respondents agreed that "the library improves the overall quality of life" and more than 70% agreed that it "enhances personal fulfillment" (n.p.). However, based on the Council's report and Jaeger et al.'s (2011) findings, libraries also contribute to the local economy and fiscal development by supporting workforce participation and employment, small businesses, and both

early and adult literacy; a library's value only increases in response to rates of unemployment, recessions, and other personal, city-and statewide economic hardship due to their ability to connect patrons and local businesses, contract local services, support workforce training programs and offer resources and internet access for job searches.

The varied services and programs that libraries provide—community meeting and maker spaces, craft programs, story hours, Lego clubs, cooking classes, conversational exchange, outreach programs and services, bookmobile services and literacy fairs—also increase the cultural and social capital of both individuals and the communities they comprise. For example, early literacy programs and services—the benefits of which are researched, known and lifelong—is imperative to ensuring 'cultural capital' or the "knowledge, skills and other cultural acquisitions, as exemplified by educational or technical qualifications" (Bourdieu, 1990, p.14). In recognizing how cultural capital supports workforce participation, employment and community cohesion, the cultural capital that libraries support inevitably and subsequently contributes to and ensures social capital. Social capital, defined by Bourdieu as the intersection of cultural, economic and political capital or status, is viewed by Varheim (2010) as also inclusive of "trusts, norms and networks, that can improve the efficiency of society" (p. 12), and of comprising "particularized trust" and "generalized trust", or the trust in known individuals within a community and the trust in the wider community, as the key components. When the library serves not only as a didactic center but also as a resource for information, connections to community organizations and cultural events, it supports a view of capital that incorporates both Bourdieu's (1990) and Varheim's (2010) understanding.

Just as libraries provide the space, support and resources for "cultural acquisitions" that can lead to greater economic stability and civic engagement, in the act of doing so, they allow for

the development of both "particularized" and "generalized" trust that can be extended to the surrounding communities (12). However, because the trust can only be developed through simple "face-to-face interaction between library users [and languages], and between users and librarians," it is imperative for users to witness that the library "is for everybody" and every language—for users to see everyone is invited (Varheim, Steinmo & Ide, 2008, pp. 881-882).

Similarly, in viewing the library as a place where "face-to-face interaction" and bi- and multilingual interaction is occurring in a neutral space, it can support the development of social capital in relation to both particular and general trust. Not only may interpersonal relationships develop from the interaction in support of "particularized trust", but the positive personal interaction is easily understood as illustrative of the space where it occurred, which supports the development of community trust and cohesion. Varheim (2010) highlights the value of libraries in the development of cultural and social capital as relevant to immigrants, in that "[m]ost immigrant populations have low social capital" (p.12). The interpersonal and multilingual interaction within a public library can therefore help deconstruct the boundaries within other public spaces (such as IHOP, restaurants and bars), and conceptually, in relation to a national identity—boundaries set against linguistic, racial, ethnic and cultural otherness.

Patron rights and standards for services. Overall, the ALA's (1996) principles and values as they are laid out in their *Bill of Rights* focus on "free expression" and "free access to ideas" regardless of the individual's "origin, background, or views" or age (n.p.). Even for minors, they clarify that any determination of age-appropriate material should be made by the parents. They emphasize repeatedly their objection to censorship both in the range of ideas and perspectives as they are contained within the public library, and they identify the "free access to ideas" as foundational for a democracy (ALA, 2017, n.p.). While seeing the free access to ideas

as central to the library's role contrasts with the earlier view of using "free access" to 'popular' material, as a lure, it reinforces the idea of the library as an interface among languages, cultures, identities, perspectives and ideas. For the same reason, the ALA (1996-2017) reiterates throughout the *Bill of Rights* the need for librarians to contain their own political views and perspectives distanced from their role and purpose of providing patrons with access to all material. The ALA additionally clarifies that diversity, as a value, is to be evident in the collections, services and programs, and the breadth of communities represented among the patrons.

The Colorado Public Library Standards (CPLS) (2016), published by the Colorado
Department of Education (CDE) and the Institute of Museum and Library Services (IMLS)
explicitly addresses the question of language with frequency throughout the Standards. The
inclusion of language within the focus of the goals for collections, programs, services, and the
library environment, allows for the Standards to clarify the library's ultimate role: sustaining
multilingualism as a resource and a "reflection of [the state's] cultural heritage"; and a way to
"understand the needs of ...[their] communities" (CDE & IMLS, 2016, p. 1). Heeding the
linguistic needs of surrounding communities becomes the way for communities to "recognize the
diversity and uniqueness of libraries across the state" (CDE & IMLS, 2016, p. 1). The focus on
community, meeting community needs, and recognizing the cultural heritage of the state,
highlights the attention to the concept of community in a more specific way.

Just as the "Collections Checklist—Future-Focused" in the CPLS states that the libraries will "ensure that the collection reflects the ethnic, cultural, and language diversity of the community" (CDE & IMLS, 2016, p.7), the "Governance" and "Human Resources" checklists emphasize that the staff and library board does "reflect the demographics of the population," and

"especially focusing on cultural and multilingual diversity" (pp. 18-20). The "Services and Programming" checklist specifies that the public libraries do "provide inclusive programs and services" and "actively involve community leaders" (p. 29), and that their future goal is to "offer programs and literature in languages spoken in the community" (p.29). In the overview of the "Community Engagement" checklist, they emphasize this "interdependent relationship" between the library and community as key to the well-being of both, libraries both give to the community in countless ways, while their purpose is also wholly dependent on them (p.9). For the same reason, the standards clarify that the goal of the marketing that libraries engage in be to communicate to the surrounding communities the ways in which the public library does "[meet] the fundamental needs of the community" (p. 21). As highlighted before, the specific focus in the CPLS (2016) on community and each community's linguistic and cultural traits and needs helps clarify that while a library may not have attained attending to those needs, it is a goal they are responsible to strive toward.

Hispanics and public libraries in the U.S. Just as there are rights set for library users based on the philosophical mission of the public library, and just as there are standards established that mark goals for current and future practices in public libraries, there are also guidelines established for services provided to Spanish-speaking patrons and immigrant communities. The guidelines, often developed from the outcomes of focus groups and pilot programs, are to facilitate the interaction between staff and patrons and communities; they also serve to orient the intent and structure of services and programs offered. WebJunction, an organization that supports the professional development of library professionals, piloted an outreach program in 2006 at a library in each of four states for the surrounding Spanish-speaking communities; in Colorado (one of the four states), the outreach program was piloted in

Longmont, CO. Other locations included New Mexico, Illinois and Florida. The families involved were chosen from surveys conducted through an outside organization; in Longmont, the organization was El Comité. Using a discussion guide, the researcher engaged the participants in conversation on how informed they were about the library and its services and collections, and on how to promote the library in the Spanish speaking community as well as include the community in its initiatives and services. It also asked what prevented each of them individually from using the library, and on the form of media most effective to share information about the library. Lastly, it solicited recommendations they would make to meet the Hispanic and Spanish-speaking community's needs; and comments on the present effectiveness of current outreach services.

While the study was conducted in 2006, the suggestions made by the participants on how to improve the outreach efforts to the Spanish-speaking community overlap the guidelines set in the "Library Self-Assessment Checklist: Serving Spanish Speaking Communities" also currently available through WebJunction (Cuesta, 2012). First presented at the first *Joint Conference of Librarians of Color* in 2006, the checklist supports the effectiveness of inclusive practices and Spanish-language services offered by libraries. The standards for practices are categorized under planning; community involvement; signage and environment; collections; programs and services; internal communications; staff and board recruitment and development; and publicity and media relations. In general, the guidelines emphasize continued efforts toward inclusive representation among patrons, staff, management, and the library board, as well as bilingual staff and management; professional development in intercultural competence; a bilingual and bicultural environment (signs, brochures and other relevant information, as well as book catalogs and collections), as well as a policy guiding the same. It also includes services offered within the

Hispanic community for members unable to get to the library; and efforts to fully publicize and communicate their efforts through media accessible to the Hispanic Community.

In short, the checklist is to both evaluate and ensure the efforts undertaken by a library in general to attract patrons are also aimed toward the Hispanic community, with adequate awareness of the particular linguistic and cultural needs of the community. The main objectives of these standards are simply to facilitate access to and usage of local libraries, as well as ensure the relevancy of the services, programs and outreach they offer. Additionally, the WebJunction website offers material to support the same efforts, inclusive of a community leader interview guide; activity planning guides; an outreach action plan guide; an outreach program workshop and follow-up curricula; and workshop handout materials—all of which are specific to Spanish.

Similar to the best practices that WebJunction identifies for serving Spanish-speaking communities, a working group formed through the U.S. Office of Citizenship also identified effective current services for immigrants offered by libraries. The best practices that the working group identified include partnerships with community organizations, the development of focus groups to help guide collections development, information, services and program development; representation on the library board; and conducting needs analyses of the relevant communities. An additional recommendation the Office of Citizenship (2010) also makes is to "include immigrant services in the budget" (USCIS & IMLS, 2010, p. 5); earmarking it as its own item in the budget helps ensure that funding sources will be identified ahead of time, and that the planning process and implementation will be effective and successful.

While WebJunction and USCIS and IMLS (2010) have identified best practices for Spanish-speaking communities and immigrants, and created guidelines and recommendations for implementing them, the actual practices implemented in libraries vary widely from one location

or city to another, and between urban and rural districts, and central and small libraries. Likewise, the use of local libraries also varies between recent Hispanic immigrants and firstgeneration Hispanics; and among recent Hispanic immigrants based on the 'social capital' (the degree of marginalization or level of formal education) with which individuals and families have come. This variation is reflected in the statistics gathered by Brown and Lopez (2015) through Pew Research Center, based on a survey conducted in 2013. While Hispanics overall appear to use their local library less than other racial groups, there is a 23% difference in use between U.S. born Hispanics and those who have immigrated here; there is a 33% difference between U.S. born and foreign-born in relation to "the relative ease of using public libraries" (p. 6); and at the time of the survey, only 36% of foreign-born Hispanics had used a library within the prior year. There is an additional 6% discrepancy among the foreign-born based on educational attainment; and a 28% discrepancy in recency of the last visit among U.S. born Hispanics based on the educational attainment (p. 13). However, among those who do visit the library, there was less variation in relation to the frequency of those visits—almost half (44-47%) visited the library monthly (p. 14). Similarly, the children of U.S. born immigrants also used the library more than children of foreign-born immigrants.

While the statistics regarding the actual use of local libraries by Hispanics are important, few interpretations can be made unless it is also known what efforts the libraries serving them actually make. For example, if the library website—the portal entryway to the library—has been translated to Spanish. Additionally, statistics cannot communicate the qualitative experience if they are not viewed in conjunction with Hispanics' self-reported experiences of their local library. Hispanic respondents to the survey identified themselves more frequently and to a greater degree than white patrons with the statements "I like to learn new things" and "I like

hunting for hard-to-find info" (p. 28). Although the responses may appear to contradict the lower percentage of use, they communicate that those libraries that have invested in attracting and serving the surrounding Hispanic communities have done so successfully. For example, Brown and Lopez (2015) highlight that "when it comes to specific library services...Hispanic library users, especially immigrants, value services such as access to free books and media or having a place to do research more than white library users...a majority of Hispanics see library closings as having major impacts on their communities" (p. 21). Not only do they see the local library as a provider of key services and resources, but also as key to the attainment of literacy and reading.

Additionally, reiterating the findings of the Urban Libraries Council (2007) study on how Libraries benefit cities, and Varheim (2010) in citing patrons' views of the library as "the living room of the community...a stable factor...an important part of the community infrastructure...a healing force...[and] the only place that isn't segregated" (p. 16), the survey highlights that both foreign-born and U.S. born Hispanics agree that "having a public library improves the quality of life in a community" (p.22). The value of Brown and Lopez's (2015) survey can help highlight the importance of inclusive practices and partnerships with both community organizations that serve immigrants, and local employers who hire them, in addition to identifying relevant channels for marketing and communication to publicize the services offered in Spanish.

#### **Public Libraries in Colorado**

The public libraries throughout Colorado came into existence in response to varying motivations and under a variety of conditions. Likewise, while some libraries did garner immediate and adequate economic and public support, others were continually transferred from one location to another and on volunteers until funding through a Carnegie grant helped the library build a permanent home, and city tax levies helped stabilize the library's operations,

allowing it to grow and expand its services. In 1977, the Colorado State Library published a compilation of summaries, each on a different library or library system's history and growth up until 1976, *Colorado Public Libraries 1876-1976: Historical Sketches* (this is inclusive of the four libraries established before 1876: Denver, Greeley, Longmont and Pikes Peak. Barsch (1977) points out in the introduction to the *Historical Sketches* that 76 libraries were founded in Colorado during the decades when immigration was at its height—1890 to 1930. While some were founded only through the efforts of townspeople, others were built with the help of both Carnegie grants, Works Progress Administration, or the National Youth Association. Others also developed out of traveling, mercantile or subscription libraries. Similarly, some started as formal projects proposed by Women's Clubs or town Study Clubs, or as less formal bookmobile services maintained by a single individual using his own truck to serve outlying farms and ranches (Barsch, 1977).

In most cases, many of the first initiatives to establish a town library between 1870 and 1930 were unstable—the collection was frequently moved from a corner in the drug store to a grocery, to the City Hall, a court house, a school, a Quonset hut or private home. In the case of Loveland, the first library collection arrived by train, was dispersed, then recollected and sent along to another destination. Likewise, in many cases, the librarian, as one of the original founders, volunteered her time or rotated shifts with other original founders. Otherwise the librarian might be paid a nominal monthly wage or provided with housing in exchange for her services. In most cases, the librarian was female, and the job included specified janitorial work. There are libraries such as Eaton Public Library, where the first librarian remained for 52 years.

In many of the sketches, the moral motivations and concerns of the founders and first librarians are evident. While some Women's Clubs saw a library as a way to lure their husbands

and local men away from the saloons, such as in the case of Boulder Public Library, others saw in the library a moral status symbol, stating that it was there for those already of good moral character, as in the case of Mesa County Public Library (Barsch, 1977).

At the outset, most libraries depended on donations of books, money, furniture, time, and space. Similarly, many of the women's clubs founding the first libraries engaged in frequent fundraising inclusive of tea parties, door-to-door solicitations, and bazaars; some created library associations to collect dues or charged a dollar for each library card. In most cases, however, economic stability only came with the town assuming responsibility for the library and funding it through tax levies. In a few cases, county or regional library systems were established rather than town libraries to broaden the tax base and therefore, increase the funding and population served. Overall, the history of many public libraries in Colorado illustrates Barsch's (1977) comment: "[1]ike all institutions that survived centuries, libraries are flexible and capable of growth" (vii). In recognizing that 76 of the 114 libraries included in the sketches were established during the height of immigration to America, and more specifically, Colorado, what is evident in reading the *Historical Sketches*, is that only one library of 114 libraries mentions developing a collection or services for any of the immigrant groups arriving to Colorado during the span of those 40 years. The Costilla County Library, founded in 1972, does describe itself as "the first library in the San Luis Valley and in the Southwest Public Library System" to have both a Spanish language and Southwest Chicano collection (Barsch, 1977, p. 51); in contrast, Delta Public Library's historical sketch omits the library's efforts to develop a Spanish book collection in 1927, and a reading area in 1930, just as the sketches on Greeley Public Library and Weld County Public Library omit the efforts—considered as early as 1933 and recognized in the CLA

Bulletin in 1938—by the House of Neighborly Services in Greeley to create a library for the Spanish Colony (CLA Bulletin, 1938; Nutter, 1928; Nutter, 1930). <sup>6</sup>

Also omitted from the sketches is Longmont Public Library's decision in 1974 to recognize that "the cultural heritage of the Southwest is plural" (Adams, 1975, p.11). The Longmont Public Library initiated a range of outreach efforts to serve the Spanish-speaking community principally employed by nearby food-processing plants. In pioneering in Colorado the incorporation of Spanish-language collections and resources, as well as valuing the input of Chicano community leaders and the presence of Spanish-speaking staff, the Longmont library soon came to possess "one of the largest collections of books [in Spanish] in the state... [with the] hope [that] it [would] be used for interlibrary loan purposes" (Adams, 1975, p. 8).

The National Association to Promote Library and Information Services to Latinos and the Spanish-Speaking, also known as REFORMA, was established in 1976—shortly after Longmont Public Library's effort to increase their services to Hispanic and Latino community members. However, it wasn't until 1994 that the Colorado Chapter formed, with the purpose of creating a network for its members to communicate, share ideas, advice, links and other resources. Since its inception, REFORMA Colorado has campaigned and provided the expertise and resources for libraries interested in serving surrounding Hispanic communities. However, its ability to support local library staff is still dependent on the initiative that a library or its staff chooses to make by joining, at minimum, REFORMA's listsery. REFORMA Colorado's goal in relation to local Hispanic and Latino communities is what the Longmont Library efforts reflected. Longmont's

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Delta County Public Library reported in the CLA Bulletin (1928) that in 1927, "On account of our large Mexican population we decided to add a collection of books in Spanish. The Holly Sugar Company agreed to pay half the bills..." (p. 25).

efforts similarly reflected the ALA's "Resolution in Support of Immigrant Rights," published more than twenty years later, principles that the Colorado State Library concurs on and expresses in their standards.

Notwithstanding, the omission in the *Historical Sketches* of efforts to serve the preexisting and arriving Spanish-speaking population as well as other immigrant populations present in Colorado is significant. It is important to know where initiatives were in place in addition to Costilla County Library, to compare initial efforts, identify which libraries have successfully sustained them, and if so, how they have resolved the challenges they encountered along the way in relation to the specific context within which they are situated.

Recognizing public libraries as a *third space*, as "low-intensive meeting places" where an interactional dynamic occurs among the "plurality of the community," among "*otherness*" and and "people of different ages, ethnicities, backgrounds, and purposes" is an imperative in a country rooted in plurality—in multilingualism and multiculturalism (Aabo & Aundunson, 2012, p. 144-146). For the same reason, it is that much more critical that a public library, as a *third space*, be fully representational—that it deconstruct any "permanent privileged center"; it is only in doing so that all identities will feel equally valued and welcomed (Elmborg, 2011, p.344). However, in recognizing the uniqueness of the context of each community, community library and library district, it is important for these principles to be applied at the local level.

In looking specifically at Colorado, it is important to understand the local narrative—of how Spanish-language initiatives offered by the library have developed in conjunction with the community's Hispanic population. Understanding the local narrative makes it possible to see whether the library functions as a *third space*, and if not, what can be done to change that. For the same reason, this present study focuses on one library district; it includes both a narrative of

the history and development of the district's Spanish-language initiatives, at the same time as it highlights what the reported obstacles and challenges have been regarding the same. The outcome of the reported obstacles and challenges are recommendations—steps that the library can take to become a fully inclusive microcosm of the surrounding linguistic and cultural communities. The goal of the recommendations is to ensure that outreach also occurs within the library, as a template and role model for the community beyond.

## CHAPTER 3 – METHODOLOGY

This study of the history and development of Spanish-language initiatives of a library district in Colorado is an ethnography. Just as important as the actual initiatives implemented by outreach and immigrant services in the district are the challenges and obstacles—the attitudes toward immigrants, and Spanish-speaking immigrants in particular. The attitudes are what have either facilitated or complicated the efforts and have made the library a democratic and inclusive place or not. For the same reason, focused-coding was important to initially group the initiatives based on kind, following the areas of programs, services, resources and collections established in Cuesta's (2012) "Library Self-Assessment Checklist. Serving Spanish Speaking Communities". Open-coding, explained by Merriam (2009) as looking at all data that could be significant in order to allow themes to emerge, was key to noticing underlying patterns and leads both within a single source of data, and across a range of sources.

Analyzing the data using both focused- and open-coding facilitated comparing and contrasting, and identifying patterns among the efforts, the motivating factors and the challenges. Likewise, it enabled identifying underlying attitudes toward bilingualism and immigrants, and what positive or negative impact those attitudes may have had on such initiatives. Finally, sequencing the data was also important, not just to create a timeline, but also to notice during what years more initiatives occurred and when there was a lull.

# **Data Overview**

The data collection and analysis was separated into four phases. The initial phase focused on collecting, grouping, coding and sequencing data from the archives of the relevant library district. The second phase focused on interviewing past and present employees of the district,

coding and sequencing data from the interviews, and identifying gaps within each of the coded categories—for example, specific timeframes and dates, or a lack of supporting details. During the third phase, follow-up interviews were conducted and further data was collected from the relevant library archives and websites. The resulting data was matched to the gaps previously identified, and then sequenced within the previously coded categories. In the final phase of data collection and analysis, the coding and grouping of all data was modified to reflect the integral relationship among the distinct subthemes and the relationship between the sub- and overarching themes; after regrouping the data, it was sequenced.

Initial data on Spanish-language initiatives developed during the early to mid- 1900's was gathered from the Colorado Association of Libraries' archives at the Denver Public Library's (DPL) Western History and Genealogy Department. During the early to mid- 1900's, newly founded public libraries in Colorado would share their events and progress in the (then) Colorado Library Association's newsletters and bulletins, inclusive of *The Occasional Leaflet*, *Colorado Libraries*, *Colorado Libraries Association Bulletin*, *Library Lens*, *Your Colorado State Library—Newsletter*, among others. Additionally, a spreadsheet was created to track the founding dates and a timeline of all libraries or library districts in Colorado. Though not yet complete, researching and tracking a brief history of the libraries helped to clarify my own understanding of how libraries in Colorado have developed over time. Through the CAL archives, libraries that first initiated services in Spanish were identified, as well as libraries that first initiated services in Spanish in the late 1980's and early 1990's.

The library district was chosen because of evidence of library services having been initiated in the county in the 1930's specifically for the Hispanic community; and of the large number of immigrants from Mexico who had been recruited by the sugar manufacturing

companies during the first decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. As previously highlighted, Spanish Colonies were established to house the workers, and community organizations and parishes became involved in settling and assimilating the workers. Local archives were used to corroborate those efforts. The district was also chosen because of the continued presence of Hispanic immigrants in agriculture and related industries there today.

#### **Sources of Data**

To develop an overview of the range of initiatives developed over time within the library district, data was gathered from the district's archives and from archived news sources. While the data from the news archives corroborated the district's early efforts, data gathered from the archives only provided a glimpse of the first sustained efforts. The archived material included scrapbooks on past Summer Reading Programs inclusive of program calendars, bookmarks, parent evaluations for one year, and other promotional material for library programs; and early ledgers of both books acquired and of patrons. Further material evidence provided by interviewees was inclusive of meeting minutes, a tally of survey results, email correspondence, and a report on attendance at programs covering a two-year span. Service brochures, library user guides and other current promotional and non-promotional material was also collected from the relevant branch libraries in the district and from the library district's website.

Additionally, various initiatives briefly mentioned in meeting minutes, bibliographies or the interviews were able to be confirmed and expanded on in relevant journal, bulletin and news articles. Notwithstanding, because no single source was able to provide exact dates regarding all initiatives, many dates had to be approximated until supporting evidence could be located. For the same reason, most dates for initiatives are only identified in terms of the year(s) when they were implemented.

Interviews. The interviewees included former and current library employees, as well as a founding member of REFORMA Colorado. Two outreach staff were interviewed at the library, while a third interviewee currently works for the DPL but is a former employee of the library. A founding member of REFORMA Colorado was also interviewed. The interviewees were chosen based on their responsibilities within the specified library district. In order to protect the identity of the participants in the study, the participants' data was labeled 'Library Informant' and is cited as such in the results. A linked list was used to contact participants for follow-up interviews or questionnaires, but the linked list and all audio recordings and questionnaire responses were kept on an encrypted flash drive.

The questions for the interviews, included in Appendix A, were standardized and partially-scheduled. The questions developed from the findings of the initial archival research as well as the readings on public library history, the history of public libraries in Colorado, and the contemporary use of the library as a third space. The aim of the questions was to understand how the Spanish-language services at the chosen library district had developed overall; what each informant's contributions to the sustained initiatives had been; and what the informant's experience of those efforts had been. However, on two occasions they were adapted more specifically to the interviewee's relationship to either one or both of the libraries. Follow-up interviews were conducted using short-answer questions sent via email. The follow-up interview questions, included in Appendix B, included clarification questions specific to the first interview.

Table 1

Overview of Phases and Steps of Data Analysis

Phase	Purpose	Data Sources	Data Analysis
1	Develop an overview of when services began and what evidence was archived. This stage clarified the role that interviews would play in collecting evidence, and the need to seek additional material that would confirm and contextualize early efforts.	Archived material (program calendars, surveys, bookmarks, reports, news articles, etc.)	1.Categorized using focused-coding specific to set areas of initiatives (i.e., programs, services, resources and collections); 2.Identified range and nature of the initiatives within each category; 3.Sequenced initiatives to identify years when more efforts occurred; 4.Gaps identified; 5.Interview questions revised and focused.
2	Develop a comprehensive understanding of the initiatives that began in 2001; to identify the challenges and obstacles; and to identify any differences among the multiple perspectives. The interviews served as the crux of the findings.	Interviews	1.Interviews transcribed; 2.Relevant excerpts grouped according to same categories; 3.Three other categories added: language, trust and library infrastructure. 4.Excerpts analyzed to identify subthemes; excerpts grouped. 5.Excerpts compiled under subthemes; 6.Excerpts compared to identify patterns (i.e., initiatives, motivating factors, challenges, etc.); 7.Excerpts sequenced, supplemented with coded data from Phase 1; 8.Gaps identified; interviewees contacted for follow-up interviews.

Phase	Purpose	Data Sources	Data Analysis
3	Follow up on pending projects and proposals; clarify details and conflicts in dates between interviewees; gather further supporting evidence of and corroborate initiatives named in the first interviews.	Follow-up interviews, articles, reports, correspondence, flyers and brochures, website	1.Follow-up interviews and further archival research conducted; resulting data categorized under the seven categories; 2. Excerpts then analyzed to match pre-existing subthemes and gaps within relevant subthemes; 3.Current initiatives updated; gaps in dates and details filled; 4.Emergent patterns of subthemes clarified; 5.Excerpts incorporated into summaries.
4	Critically analyze, code and categorize initiatives, attitudes, challenges and insight on the infrastructure of the library; identify a coherent order to present the categories and subthemes; filter out my personal reactions to the attitudes and obstacles identified to create a collective narrative.	Summaries	1.Summaries under each subtheme revised; 2.Summaries regrouped under dated initiatives, collections, language and staff, translations and funding. 3.Dated initiatives for the first library grouped (early and mid- 1900's; 1970's and 80's; then in 5-year increments beginning in later 1980's); 4.Other categories identified by overriding focus; 5.Relevant secondary themes identified under 'trust' subtheme; 5.Summaries specific to 'trust' incorporated into discussion on language and staff, and funding.

The original objective of the interviews was to develop a sequential narrative of initiatives; however, the objective was modified. Many of the interviewees had worked at the library in question between ten to twenty years, only focused on developing Spanish-language initiatives and making the library inclusive of the Hispanic community. Their narratives were biographical and personal; as a result, the interviews were used to construct the aforementioned collective narrative. It encompasses how, when and why initiatives were developed and what challenges were encountered in implementing them, from a collective perspective.

## **Data Analysis**

The original goal of the research was to research the initiatives of two library districts, and then create a digital archive of each library's sequenced initiatives. The digital archive was to be, upon request, accessible to other interested library districts or individual libraries in rural, underserved or underfunded areas of Colorado. Data in the archive was to feasibly inform other districts about possible Spanish language services, resources, programs and collections to consider implementing.

However, the results of the data collection and analysis clarified the need to focus on only one library, and to present the history and development of the initiatives in the context of a narrative. For the same reason, the final phase of the data analysis involved constructing a fully synthesized and collective narrative about the library's Spanish-language initiatives, the challenges confronted in developing them, and how those challenges relate to attitudes expressed by library administration toward language and immigrants in general, and Hispanic immigrants in particular. Likewise, it made it possible to include in the narrative the conflict between the current marketing perspective in place at some libraries, and the nature of outreach work and service professions. The aforementioned relationships are imperative to understanding how the

initiatives have developed, and the strategies that outreach and librarians devised to circumvent the challenges and obstacles.

#### **CHAPTER 4 – FINDINGS**

## **Initiatives**

The findings included in this study cover the initial historical efforts established to serve Weld County's Spanish-speaking population up until the present date. Though the initial efforts were those of a community association serving Greeley's Spanish Colony, they were inclusive of a library and calls for books and book donations were often made by the county public library; likewise, in recognizing that outreach at public libraries currently and frequently works in collaboration with community organizations, the initial efforts reflect a similar collaboration. The findings continue with evidence of initiatives begun up until 2001, when outreach began at the Weld Library District. The narrative, compiled predominantly from the interviews, follows; it is the greater focus of the findings and is inclusive of services, resources and programs; collections; staff and translations; and challenges and obstacles.

Initial efforts. In 1933, *The Greeley Tribune* shared the news that a library was included in the plans to "work [...] for social life among members of the Spanish Colony" (p.1). The article called for "[p]eople [...] to give their old or disused books;" subsequent articles in *The Greeley Tribune* highlight the range of services and programs that the "social center", the House of Neighborly Services (HNS), established to help the Spanish Colony (p.1).

By 1935, the HNS reported to *The Greeley Tribune* that "[m]ore than 11,000 persons ha[d] passed through the doors of the [HNS] at 203 Fourteenth Avenue in the [preceding] seven months" (p.3). HNS offered "Sunday School, clinics, kindergartens [...] tak[ing] care of the sick, and furnish[ing] means of work and play [inclusive of] handiwork [...,] woodworking classes, physical education, English, and manual arts" (p.3). In addition to supporting an arts

organization, "El Águila Real," that would meet at the Washington School<sup>7</sup> for "dramatic, musical and art programs," the HNS "established [circulating] libraries" (1935, p.3). When considering the variety of programming—inclusive of LEGO and Science Clubs and activities, family yoga, knitting and sewing, arts and crafts, guitar lessons, music and theater play for children, movie clubs, seed libraries, and educational forums on identity theft, start-ups and genealogy among other topics—offered by many libraries today, the HNS offered a comparable range of programming to Greeley's Spanish Colony.

As highlighted earlier, the library maintained by the HNS was recognized by the Colorado Library Association (CLA) in 1938; and in 1946, *The Greeley Tribune* again briefly mentions the "small library" but doesn't mention the other services previously offered by the HNS. This is the last mention of the library unit maintained by the HNS.

Decades later, in 1979, the Greeley Public Library (GPL) and Weld County Library worked collaboratively to count "Spanish surnamed" individuals residing in Greeley and Evans. The libraries identified the registered borrowers with Spanish surnames and any duplicates between the two libraries and differentiated between children and students. However, it is not stated what the information obtained was used for.

Between 1979 and 2001, the only program offered relevant to Hispanic families of Greeley and Weld County was a cultural Christmas celebration—Las Posadas---in 1986; and while the Weld Library District (WLD) service brochure was translated to Spanish prior to 2001, it is unclear in what year. Any outreach efforts provided in the 1990's were not necessarily

<sup>8</sup> Outreach operated through the Weld Library District; formed in 1986, WLD included both Greeley Public Library and Weld County Library as branch libraries. For more information see http://www.northernplainspl.org/about.html.

52

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See no.14 at https://visitgreeley.org/wp-content/uploads/history-tour.pdf for more information.

directed toward Hispanics nor the Hispanic community, but they may have been beneficiaries of some of the efforts. However, there is no evidence archived of any of these outreach efforts.

Outreach 2001-2005. Between 2000 and 2005, the physical evidence archived by the library of outreach efforts to Hispanic community members is minimal. It includes Spanish-language flyers advertising the Summer Reading Program (SRP); parent evaluations of the SRP in 2000; and a reading log with instructions translated to Spanish for the 2002 program. The 2003 SRP calendar included in a scrapbook of the 2003 program also highlighted "cuentos y actividades semanal[es]," inclusive of a well-known bilingual Storyteller, Pam Faro (Informant). Promotional bookmarkers in Spanish and bilingual program calendars were also saved from 2004 and 2005. Despite the dearth of material evidence, interviews with outreach clarified WLD's efforts—beginning in 2001—to develop services for Hispanic families beyond the Summer Reading Program.

When Weld Library District decided to implement outreach services, it was in response to the decreased use of the Lincoln Park Branch, located in a predominantly Hispanic neighborhood in downtown Greeley. The goal was to both increase the branch's use and to serve the surrounding Hispanic community. At first, outreach at WLD was inclusive of one staff, an employee of WLD already, and no job description; administration differed in their ideas of whether outreach should focus more on children or adults. However, this staff did begin to build up the foundation of the outreach services (now named Community Engagement) that are currently offered by High Plains Library District (HPLD).

Because there was no job description to guide the outreach staff, Alire and Archibeque's (1998) book, *Serving Latino Communities*, became instrumental during those first years. Alire and Archibeque (1998) emphasize reaching out to groups that already offer services to the

Hispanic community; since outreach was "one person working 24 hours," contacting "groups that were already coalesced" was the most effective way to "maximize [...] leverage" (Informant). For the same reason, initial efforts in the Fall of 2001 included "meet and greets, with agencies and organizations" such as CBOCES and Head Start; both already had established relationships with the migrant and Spanish-speaking families in and around Greeley. In addition, outreach gathered information from other staff on who they saw needed help—"[...] a particular group, [...] a population, [...] a neighborhood, [...] an organization" (Informant). Most of the initial efforts were self-directed and informal.

Outreach decided to focus on organizations that, in addition to already serving the Hispanic community, also focused on low-literacy families and did home visits often. But, an unexpected challenge was identifying who to talk to at the organizations. For example, CBOCES runs a program formerly called "Bright Beginnings"; but CBOCES is under United Way, so outreach had to identify who at United Way to talk to. Outreach encountered a similar challenge with Nurse Family Partnerships. But outreach sought out books, websites and listservs, and looked at other resources to determine what services to establish, who to direct them toward, how to establish them, and how to maintain them.

The first main need outreach identified was Adult Education resources and material—ESL, GED, Citizenship, etc.—services and resources that would help families "get ahead economically" and be more "economically sound or stable"; the dropout rate in Weld County confirmed for outreach the need to focus on both adult and family literacy. Although it was clear the dropout rate was not specific to Hispanic families, it was prevalent among them. It also became a way for outreach to expand their focus beyond children's storytime.

One first task was to draw the Hispanic community to the Public Computer Centers (PCC) to be installed in a grocery in Pearce, a coffeeshop in Milliken and a community center in Evans. The PCCs, which closed after funding ended, were in areas where there was a larger population of Spanish-speaking and migrant families. Outreach also began to develop its relationship with both CBOCES and Head Start. WLD additionally worked with CBOCES to open a Gates Lab at the Lincoln Park Branch, with the hopes of specifically attracting and serving migrant families, and hired its first bilingual reference librarian for the branch. A Literacy Symposium was organized for Children's Book Week in November of 2001, which included a bilingual storyteller and served to attract Head Start and other professionals.

Although outreach's first attempt to collaborate with Head Start in 2001 was unsuccessful, a year later, outreach was invited to speak at a parents' night at one Head Start. This led to speaking at another and then "making the rounds at parent nights" and after a leadership change at Head Start, to offering "a monthly bilingual storytime" (Informant). Outreach, accompanied by a second staff member proficient in Spanish, began visiting each of the 14 Head Start centers in Weld County once a month, connecting the story time to the weekly theme at each center. Additionally, outreach created more than 50 "bilingual themed bookbags" for the children to check out from branch libraries (Informant). While the rotating storytime ended when the WLD administration transferred the responsibility of maintaining the relationship with Head Start to the individual branch libraries, the liaison is an example of outreach's early efforts. Outreach was learning "how to do outreach" at the local level.

Between 2002 to 2005, various advances were made in Weld County's Hispanic community. The Home Delivery flyer was translated to Spanish, and because outreach had since joined REFORMA, the National Association to Promote Library and Information Services to

Latinos and the Spanish-speaking, the library agreed to send outreach to the 2003 Joint REFORMA/ Mountain Plains Library Association meeting in Nevada. In addition to professional development opportunities and general insight on "programming, literature and reference services for Latinos and Spanish-speaking," outreach returned from the meeting with bibliographic lists of Spanish-language books to consider for purchase for WLD's collection (Informant).

The Spanish-language collection was also expanded in 2003 due to the WLD's participation in a rotating Spanish-language collection established by the DPL with a LSTA grant. Participating in the rotating collection increased their Spanish-language collection from "five shelves and half a spin rack...[and] a few magazines" to double that (Informant). Each of the participating libraries received two or three tubs of materials at a time, and they would advertise them in the catalog. When the tubs were to be circulated again, each library pulled the collection and sent it on. When the grant ended, each library kept whatever material they had last received. Soon after, an individual was hired for collection development who was interested in serving Spanish-speaking patrons, and outreach was given permission to go with the children's collection development staff to the Feria Internacional del Libro in Guadalajara.

Programming between 2002 and 2005 included annual participation in Greeley's Cinco de Mayo celebration, at which outreach would present "Spanish language and bilingual children's books" at a booth; and organizing two more Literacy Symposiums in 2002 and 2003, and the 2003 cultural program, "Galletita y Cuentos," which included bilingual storytellers.

Occasional in-house bilingual programming for children was offered at least up until 2007, and off-site bilingual storytimes and programs or activities were included in the Summer Reading Program (SRP).

In 2004, the (former) Lincoln Park Branch was remodeled: both "interior and exterior signage in Spanish" was hung and a new bilingual reference librarian was hired (Informant). After the remodeling, outreach began giving bilingual tours of the branch for families of Head Start, and similar bilingual presentations to parents at Back-to-School nights and at Adult ESL class locations.

Outreach 2006-2009. Despite outreach's attempt to increase the collections and services offered to Hispanic families and individuals in the early 2000's, the library was not seen by immigrants as a place to locate needed resources when the immigration raids on the Swift & Co. plant occurred in Greeley in 2006. The library's efforts were mostly centered around family and early literacy. However, outreach began to push the WLD administration to create a Latino Services Work Team to increase the outreach efforts for Hispanic families. Inclusive of 10 to 14 library staff, the work team's first meeting clarified their "programming and promotional ideas" and "projects to [...] contribute to Latino Services," and stated its purpose to be:

[to] consult on, design, plan and implement off-site and in-house programming and services tailored to the needs of the Latino community in WLD service areas. The committee might also [...] propose marketing strategies, provide and/or proof translations, and represent the district at venues/functions that draw Latino populations. ("A Proposal for Latino Services", 2006)

The second and last meeting, held in early 2007, included 9 committee members and the team had been renamed Latino Services Advisory Committee (LSAC). The meeting minutes state that the WLD administration "is committed to the idea of 'equitable service delivery' [...] for our Spanish-speaking, bilingual and bicultural patrons" and that the work team would serve to evaluate the current services as well as implement and promote further services. Such as those identified in Cuesta's (2006) checklist that outreach adapted for the WLD and sent to multiple branches and the administration. The minutes identify past efforts, inclusive of:

bilingual off-site storytimes at Head Start, Plaza del Milagro [migrant housing] child care and SRP in the parks; bilingual presentations at parents' nights, community meetings and ESL classes; participation in community events; researching the literacy needs of Spanish-speakers via LAN [ a literacy agency network]; developing a curriculum for bilingual information literacy classes in 2005; and offering in-house Latino Services. (LSAC, 2007)

Outreach also shared the results of their adapted version of Cuesta's (2012) original checklist at the meeting; they include responses from Outreach, Administration, 5 other libraries and one anonymous source. The questions, as highlighted previously, cover planning, community involvement, facilitating access and creating a welcoming environment, collections, programs and services, internal communications, staff recruitment and development, board recruitment and development, publicity and media relations. At most libraries only one staff member responded to the survey, and staff rated their library as low in its efforts to involve and serve Spanish-speaking patrons. Three libraries saw more success regarding programs and services, bilingual and culturally responsive staff, participation in Latino community events, tracking program attendance or delivering services at Latino community centers. Only Lincoln Park rated itself as substantially more successful in its efforts to facilitate access and offer programs and services.

The minutes highlight the need to continue improving and focusing the efforts, "both 'big picture' or long-term needs and short-term, easy to accomplish projects that will help build interest" (LSAC). While twelve proposals were made by attending members, the minutes state that "no tasks were assigned and no conclusions were drawn"; that was the last LSAC meeting (LSAC, 2007). Ultimately, outreach's proposal for a permanent Latino Services Advisory Committee was rejected. Outreach stated, "…I wanted a committee and I was told I could have a short-term task-force" (Informant). Notwithstanding, the outcome of the short-term Latino task force was long-term: the task force translated the entire interface of the WLD catalog to make the

collection more accessible to Spanish-speaking patrons. In the same year, the library additionally published a Spanish-language version of their website, "Mi Biblioteca" (Informant).

A Report on Programs and Classes offered by the WLD also tallied the attendance from 2005 to 2007 at the programs named in the LSAC meeting minutes, in addition to attendance for computer classes in Spanish, homework help with occasional bilingual tutors, and block parties; the programs were taken from the district calendar. Attendance varied; for example, while on average, 23.7 children attended off-site bilingual storytimes, Farr Regional Library offered one bilingual storytime over the two years with little or no attendance. On average, four students attended the computer classes in Spanish, though this average is lower than the 12 stated by staff who taught the class (Informant). Most of the classes were offered at Lincoln Park Branch but also for a time by a librarian at Carbon Valley (Informant). The other events that consistently drew a crowd were the Spanish and bilingual adult informational programs such as Parent Nights, and the special events such as Día del Nino/ Día del Libro.

Two other programs developed between 2005 and 2007 included "Every Child Ready to Read" and "Weld County Reads". Outreach worked in collaboration with Head Start and AIMS Community College to promote "Every Child Ready to Read," and developed bilingual programs and trainings for parents and staff (Informant). The more generalized reading program, "Weld County Reads," funded by a Big Read grant from the National Endowment of the Humanities, included distributing "hundreds of copies of [a bilingual version of] *Bless Me*, *Ultima*," by Rudolfo Anaya, at book talks to expand awareness of Latino authors.

In response to their frequent focus on family literacy, outreach also developed the network mentioned earlier, LAN; "mainly an email group," LAN met quarterly, and was inclusive of Right to Read, IRC, BOCES, HIPPY and Parents as Teachers. The goal was for all

to be equally informed about "what's going on with Early Childhood Education in Greeley and [...] what Spanish-speakers need, what [...] Somali speakers need... [or] the Burmese mothers need" (Informant); and for all to recognize and understand that "[y]ou can't do outreach for speakers of other languages without also addressing this literary piece" (Informant).

After the immigration raids at Swift & Co., JBS S.A. bought the meat processing plant and began recruiting refugee populations to work there. By 2009, the Somali refugee population in Greeley had increased to around 700, in addition to refugees from Southeast Asia, and immigrants from Cuba, Afghanistan, Burma, among other countries (Finley, 2009). A grant allowed for the initiative, Realizing Our Community (ROC), to move forward to support outreach's aim to expand their community involvement, attend relevant community meetings and serve both the immigrant communities impacted by the raids, and the refugees recruited by JBS.

Home delivery, which outreach had been responsible for since 2001, was discontinued in 2007; it was replaced by the lobby stop van. Though Home Delivery had included two patrons who were bilingual—one who preferred to read in English and the other in Spanish—discontinuing the service allowed for outreach to focus their time further on services, resources and programs for Spanish-speaking families and individuals.

There was a significant increase in bilingual and Spanish-language programs beginning in 2007. Farr Library "featured a Spanish-language film (*Calle 54*) in its monthly film discussion" during the *Semana Latina* hosted by the city; and, as part of "Weld County Reads," the library hosted a presentation of *White Gold Laborers: The Story of Greeley's Spanish Colony* by local authors, Gabe and Jody Lopez. Other bilingual presentations and tours of the Lincoln Park Branch were given to Greeley Transitional House, Head Start programs and ESL classes to increase awareness of what the Library had to offer to the Hispanic community. Additionally,

outreach presented a program on the history of Hispanics in Colorado to students in CBOCES' migrant education program; and outreach also participated in the Migrant Appreciation Picnic offered annually by the Northern Area Migrant Coalition.

HipHop Madness, a signature program that was developed in 2008 at the Centennial Park Branch, aimed specifically "to engage Latino and at-risk youth" (Informant). Although the University of Northern Colorado (UNC) assumed control of it, the program continues today with the involvement of the Colorado Dance Collective and continues to work to "encourage higher education through Hip Hop culture and entertainment" (Hackman, 2015).

Also in 2008, outreach applied for its first "The American Dream Starts at Your Library" grant, used to purchase two hundred dollars of Adult literacy material for Head Start. The materials were distributed in tubs to Head Start centers, to circulate the materials as they saw appropriate among parents (Informant). Outreach presented on the grant at the annual American Library Association (ALA) conference that same year (Informant).

Otherwise, programming already in place continued through 2008 and 2009: Cinco de Mayo, Latino Luncheon, off-site Summer Reading, Migrant Appreciation events and bilingual storytimes and presentations at Head Start and through "Every Child Ready to Read". In addition to renaming WLD the High Plains Library District (HPLD) in 2008, and continuing the computer classes in Spanish, various new initiatives also began: developing an ESL curriculum specific to libraries; translating the interface of the online catalog; drafting a proposal to fund computer classes in Spanish at HUD housing and a grant to engage further with the Somali population. Likewise, in 2009, the translation of the Spanish-language district website was updated, at this point inclusive of the on-line catalog, Spanish HIP; a blog on Latino literature

and culture; and Library guides in Spanish—one, "Mi Guía," was specific to Adult literacy resources, whereas the other was specific to literature and media collections in Spanish.

Outreach 2010- 2015. In asking for feedback on the ESL tubs at the Head Start Centers, outreach understood that parents wanted citizenship classes. Outreach applied for and received a second "The American Dream Starts at Your Library" grant to fund the classes, which also led to the hiring of an additional bilingual and bicultural outreach staff to share in the growing responsibilities.

While the citizenship classes were implemented in response to a voiced need, outreach clarified that what hindered understanding the integral needs of both the larger Spanish-speaking immigrant population as well as the refugee population was the lack of community analyses of non-traditional and diverse users. Outreach had hoped that a community analysis to be conducted five or six years ago would focus on non-traditional users, but only one group of "non-primary English speakers" present at a Right to Read session was included to represent the varied language groups and both refugees and immigrants in Weld County (Informant).

Despite the lack of community analyses, new initiatives were developed in addition to continuing the existing ones. The HPLD began a Winter Reading program that they promoted to Spanish-speaking adults; hosted both a Colorado REFORMA meeting and Voices of the Americas (VOTA), a space for immigrants and refugees to share their stories; and provided training programs for volunteers for the adult education, ESL and citizenship classes. The computer classes in Spanish also continued both at Lincoln Park and HUD housing; and outreach hosted an informational Naturalization session with representatives from USCIS. Furthermore in 2010, a survey on the library district for patrons was translated to Spanish; the district proposed forming a translation team; and outreach and a branch librarian appeared on "El Tigre"

(102.1FM) as guest speakers. Additionally, a branch librarian worked with the Kress Cinema to air the 2010 World Cup Game between Mexico and France—an event that was successful enough for the Cinema to continue airing the world cup in subsequent years (Informant). A branch librarian also received a grant to offer GED classes, which he publicized in Spanish and aimed at a Spanish-speaking audience.

Supporting Parents in Early Literacy through Libraries (SPELL), which operated from 2014-2016 and was funded by an IMLS grant offered to the Colorado State Library, focused on "assisting library staff in their effort to support caregivers in practicing early literacy techniques with their children" (SPELL, 2016). Through SPELL, outreach partnered with HIPPY on early literacy, and put together boxes with "manipulatives in them, books, parent tips on early literacy and stuff like that" (Informant). Parents could check the boxes out from the library, but the early literacy tip cards became outreach's signature resource—they were translated into Spanish for the 1000 Books before Kindergarten program, as part of SPELL. The initiative also included tours of the library and family story time for HIPPY families, and they invited LeVar Burton, former host of PBS's Reading Rainbow. While the literacy tip cards in Spanish are still in use, once the SPELL grant ended, the program ended also.

Around 2014, the HPLD was also able to begin providing leisure programming in Spanish at some branches in addition to attending to survival needs—adequate attendance was what made it viable, in addition to an increase in bilingual and bicultural staff in the last three to five years. Since then, much of the Spanish-language programming has occurred at Riverside Library and Cultural Center, where the Spanish-speaking population tends to go now that the Lincoln Park Branch was moved and reduced.

Ongoing, recent and current outreach efforts. An ongoing responsibility of outreach dating from 2002 has been to export the SRP to parks, often in predominantly Latino neighborhoods. The goal has been for kids in the parks programs to have the same experience of the in-house SRP, inclusive of bilingual storytimes, activities and programs. While during the first years the storytimes were mostly bilingual, once Greeley shifted to an English-first focus in the public schools, the storytimes followed suit. The impact of Greeley's English-first politic was such that "even if [kids] would have liked to hear the story in Spanish they weren't going to raise their hand and say [it]...because the pressure was such" (Informant). It is unclear if this trend has continued or shifted now that a bilingual charter school, Salida del Sol Academy, is operating in Greeley.

Although the Spanish-language version of the HPLD website, "Mi Biblioteca," was lost in 2016 when the district updated its website, in roaming through the three branches, there were flyers, service brochures and guides to the Dewey Decimal System available in Spanish and visibly located. Two additional flyers in Spanish were for adults or children who want help in creating a personalized reading list. Although the website cannot be navigated in Spanish, current HPLD Spanish-language programming is listed on the events calendar. The majority of Spanish-language programming is focused at Riverside Library and Cultural Center, Centennial Library and Lincoln Park Branch. Although it is infrequent on the January to May 2018 Calendar of events and classes, it does occur, and includes computer classes, workshops on health, navigating the internet, job searches, and ethnic cooking, and an intercambio (conversational language exchange).

Reading Deeply in Community/Leyendo a Fondo en Comunidad, which was offered in 2017 but does not appear on High Plain's calendar for Spring 2018, is an example of recent or

current programming. Also known as *People and Stories/ Gente y Cuentos* (the name the informant used), the program was initially established in communities in 1986. With funding from the National Endowment of the Humanities, it was adapted in 2010 to libraries under the name *Leyendo a Fondo en Comunidad*. The program functions as a book club, using short stories that are read aloud during each session and are followed by a discussion that encourages critical literacy. Although the goal of the program is to switch to English after the second semester, outreach was considering continuing the program in Spanish to further support adult literacy development of the participants in Spanish.

PASOS, which is funded by United Way, focuses on "quality home child care" and allows mothers to learn about early childhood needs, development and literacy. Participating mothers receive "the equivalent of an early childhood development associates in 16 weeks" (Informant). The material and curriculum are in Spanish, which allows the program to "recruit Latina mothers—this is the seventh round of the 16-week program" (Informant). To support the program, outreach has created bilingual book bags that they keep at the library; they inform participants of the bags and the other bilingual material and programs that they can access at the library. And while outreach and PASOS is hoping to get the curriculum translated to other languages relevant to Greeley's and Weld County's immigrants and refugees, doing so would require "global grant money [...] or finding somebody in their country who already knows Piaget's theories of learning [...] it's just gonna take research and funding" (Informant).

During the initial interviews in 2017, outreach was collaborating with the Immigrant Resource Center (IRC) in Greeley to plan a literacy fair during the summer of 2017. The fair was to include literacy information and activities for families and would serve to attract potential

students to classes offered at the IRC, as well as patrons to the library. The literacy fair was to be part of a larger collaboration with the IRC in support of family and adult literacy.

The main resource is an adult education library that includes ESL, GED, dictionaries, bilingual dictionaries and citizenship material. Previously, the IRC was one of HPLD's lobby stops; but the students weren't using the service. Outreach and the IRC decided to increase the library's involvement with the IRC and offer a library day once a week, staffed by HPLD. This resource is in English; is offered to all immigrants and refugees who use the IRC and includes storytime and citizenship classes. The IRC also shared its curriculum so outreach could complement it with relevant materials from the adult literacy collection.

An ongoing service historically offered by the HPLD is the bookmobile. While the service area has included outlying areas where there are Spanish-speaking families, the service has typically been directed toward traditional English-speaking users. However, since 2009, the push to include books and information in Spanish began. While "[...] sometimes some of the people who were the traditional bookmobile staff were like—do I need this on the bookmobile? Why do we have to do this?" Outreach stated, "[...] we got there" (Informant). It is unclear what genres are included in Spanish, but an informational flyer on the library and a flyer specifically for Head Start parents are included. Because the bookmobile does stop at Head Start locations, for some kids, it is their first experience of a library. The flyer for Head Start parents, printed in English and Spanish, offers literacy tips, a list of the books read at storytime, and information about the library—as well as a picture of the librarian.

Although the push to include Spanish-language books on the bookmobile began in 2009, the collections for the lobby stop van, the IRC and the halfway house are not often inclusive of books in languages other than English. While it is feasible to include books in Spanish, it's

"almost impossible to purchase items in some of [the other] language [groups]" represented in Greeley and Weld County (Informant).

One program and resource that outreach is interested in developing for Spanish-speaking and first-generation families is a comprehensive support program for young adults interested in attending college. The program would support students and their families throughout the college application process. Similar to other initiatives, outreach would collaborate with other organizations that already have the trust and time of students to facilitate gaining students' trust and interest. The resource would support students following vocational and alternative higher education tracks; and applying to four-year colleges or for financial aid. While outreach needs more staff and funding to offer this service, it is "very much on our radar" (Informant). An additional possible initiative is developing a Plaza Comunitaria program in support of adult literacy in Spanish, possibly in collaboration with CBOCES.

HPLD was undergoing an internal reorganization during the first interviews in January of 2017. There was a new Associate Director of Community Engagement and the Public Information Office (PIO) and Outreach were being incorporated under Community Engagement. Because of the administrative reorganization, the future role and responsibilities of outreach were unclear. But previous internal reorganization—for example, when the liaison with Head Start was shifted from outreach to branch libraries—had gone poorly; the responsibility for the collaboration was inevitably returned to outreach. For the same reason, outreach was uncertain if the change would work in favor of or against their efforts.

Notwithstanding, outreach did clarify that regardless of the outcome of the merger, HPLD needed to create a greater sense of inclusion: they needed "more Latino stuff" in general—"more Latino books [...] everything. Like, our signage [...] we need staff [... and]

collections that truly reflects our populations. It's only if the Latino population truly sees itself integrated into the library will they full believe that the library is for them as well as white people" (Informant).

Collections. In 1914 and 1915, a total of six novels in Spanish, by Spanish authors, were donated to the Greeley Public Library; likewise, in 1927, three more novels in Spanish were donated, as well as a publication series from the Hispanic Society of America. While the next novel in Spanish donated to the library was in 1936, in 1934 when the plans to create the HNS to serve the Spanish Colony were underway, a call for "Spanish American books" was published in *The Greeley Tribune* (p.1); the library, inclusive of a reading room, was identified as "one of the chief attractions of the [HNS]. A Spanish weekly newspaper comes in for its share of attention" and "[n]one of the books [we]re ever damaged or lost [...] injured or destroyed" (1935, p.3). In 1946, *The Greeley Tribune* again briefly mentions the "small library" consisting of one hundred books from the Weld County Library," that included a reading room, and newspapers and magazines—though it doesn't state if the newspapers include the Spanish weekly (p.7).

In 1934, the first Spanish-surnames appeared in the ledger (spanning 1934 to 1941) of Greeley Public Library patrons. However, there were no ledgers available clarifying what books in Spanish the Greeley Public Library may have received, nor what books were donated for use by the Spanish Colony. Unfortunately, up until 2001, there was no available information on any collections in Spanish held by the WLD.

When outreach began in 2001, the Spanish-language collection—the Spanish-language children's collection in particular—was very limited. However, one of the first tasks for outreach was to filter through multiple boxes of material donated by the Mexican Consulate from the Plaza Comunitaria program. The library added some and donated the others. Otherwise, their

Spanish language collection at this time was limited and mostly for adults (Informant). However, as mentioned previously, a staff member at DPL received a grant in 2003 to create a rotating collection of Spanish-language material, and WLD accepted to participate.

Through the rotating collection, each participating district would receive two or three tubs of Spanish-language material. WLD would advertise the material in the catalog. When it was time to rotate the material, they pulled it and sent the tubs to another library and then received new ones. The rotating collection was an effective way for WLD to increase their Spanish-language collection. After the grant ended, each district kept the last tub of material they had received; most of the material was housed at the Lincoln Park Branch where "the largest Spanish language collection for a very long time" was until the Lincoln Park Branch was moved and their collection reduced (Informant).

As mentioned earlier, around the time that the rotating collection ended, someone with an active interest in developing the High Plains Spanish-language collection was hired in 2004 and sent along with the children's collection staff to the Feria Internacional del Libro in Guadalajara. In addition to the rotating collection, these two factors proved imperative to developing the Spanish-language collection. The new collection development's efforts are evident in email correspondence between outreach and collections in 2007. Collections states that the budget for Spanish-language and bilingual material doubled between 2004 and 2005, from \$25,000 to \$50,000; and had increased to \$75,000 by 2007—7.5% of the \$1 million materials budget; although an "analysis of the collection and use [was] conducted in 2006," the results are unknown (Informant, Personal Communication, 2007). Collections also reportedly continued to attend the yearly Feria Internacional del Libro in Guadalajara, and was able to send the Library Materials Supervisor from one of the branches to a book fair in Argentina.

However, outreach did state that they mapped the collection of the middle school library in Kersey a few years later, when the Hispanic population in Kersey was close to 48% (Informant). Despite the large Hispanic population, only 5% of the books at that time represented "something other than white" (Informant). When language—any language other than English—was factored in, the percentage was even lower. Outreach clarified that mapping a collection is key to determining how well the collection represents the surrounding community; however, they were pretty sure the overall High Plains collection has never been mapped due to the cost and time it requires.

Just as necessary as ensuring the collection represents the surrounding community is the location of the Spanish-language collections at the branch libraries. This is evident in the ongoing debate about where to shelve bilingual books, and bilingual and Spanish-language children's books. In January 2017, during a visit to Farr, the children's bilingual and Spanish language books were located next to the adult collection, versus in the children's room where all the other children's books were. Outreach commented that the library was struggling to circulate their bilingual and Spanish-language board books.

By the second interview, Farr had decided to interfile both the bilingual and Spanish-language board books with the board books in English. Circulation increased because, as outreach clarified, Spanish-speaking parents don't take their children to the adult collection, they take them to the children's room. Likewise, because both non-Spanish and non-English speakers—be it children or adults—can read a bilingual book, outreach has recommended interfiling all adults' and children's bilingual books to also increase their circulation. Fortunately, Farr's success has encouraged others to "[see] the validity in inter-shelving [...]" and to

"[follow] their lead" (Informant). Additionally, the collections development staff "trusts the professional opinions of her staff [so] [e]ven if she has misgivings, she will try it" (Informant).

Although individual libraries and collections can decide whether to intershelve bilingual books or not, outreach clarified that PIO oversees the arrangement and interior decoration of each branch library; this includes, signage, pictures, posters, the end caps, shelf tops, displays, etc. PIO's role in the libraries' decision-making process is illustrated by their refusal to allow the Kersey library to display stained glass artwork from a local author and community member—PIO made the library "get rid of them" because they "did not like them" (Informant).

PIO visits each library once a year to make changes. Outreach commented that despite evidence to the contrary, PIO denies being "responsible for the collection, where it went and how it went together": while PIO says they "support the libraries in making those decisions", the branches say the contrary, that "they don't have that ability" (Informant). Transparency regarding the control over each branch's displays and arrangements is important; two key questions on the adapted "Success Checklist" are if "Spanish language collection is easily visible and accessible with seating available" and if "Spanish language collection displays and materials are in areas where people gather" (Serving Spanish-Speaking Communities Tally Sheet, 2007).

While being a member library does give the member library access to greater purchasing power that they wouldn't have otherwise, collection development, arrangement and displays of material in Spanish at member libraries is ultimately decided by the librarian. For the same reason, collections in Spanish at member libraries varies. Ault and Eaton have developed a collection for the surrounding Hispanic community, as well as Platteville, Johnstown and Fort Lupton Public and School Library. Fort Lupton also appears to offer a Spanish-language

brochure recommending newer books (in English) in their collection and a list of general programs for the month.<sup>9</sup>

The Riverside Library and Cultural Center is now the library that attracts most Spanish-speaking patrons and families. This was evident in visiting the Riverside, Centennial Park and Lincoln Park branches; the Spanish-language and bilingual collections were substantively larger at Riverside Library and Centennial Park than those offered at Lincoln Park.

Staff and translations. As outreach clarified, despite many people's understanding to the contrary, Spanish is not a monolithic language; there are variations of the meaning of words, expressions, and verb conjugations, and in how to address people. In the program, *Reading Deeply in Community/ Leyendo a Fondo en Comunidad*, many of the discussions revolve around a word and its meaning for each participant, based on the participant's own cultural variation of Spanish. Outreach described the conversation during one session:

I had a lady who was born in Southeastern Colorado, her parents were originally one from Mexico and one Navajo, so the Spanish she learned... was one Spanish, then I had a woman from Mexico, and I had a woman from El Salvador, and then my Spanish which is school, you know, and a junior year in Madrid, So a lot of Castilian...And we'd get to these words on the page and go, well, I have no idea what that one is, well in Mexico it means [this], well here it means that...we'd have long discussions just about vocabulary because Spanish is not monolithic [...]. (Informant)

Just as there can be little agreement about the meaning of a word, both informants clarified that among the different departments, there is little agreement on what a Spanish-language initiative constitutes. It's "part of our problem with serving these groups [...] there is not common understanding of what it means or what it takes" (Informant). So, while one informant defined it as just that—a program or service provided in Spanish; another stated that experience had

72

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> When I attended a bilingual fair at the Fort Lupton High School in October 2017, the library had a booth with Spanish-language brochures of new books and programming.

modified it to be "something that welcomes people who speak other languages" and "[...] tries to bring people who speak Spanish into our libraries" (Informant).

The informants also varied in their assessment of what the library had achieved. One emphasized that the HPLD still needs as stated before, "more Latino stuff," while the other highlighted they had already begun to provide "leisure programming in Spanish" (Informants). However, both agreed on the obstacles they consistently encounter in getting "more Latino stuff," offering "leisure programming," and increasing bilingual and bicultural staff (Informant).

In 2001, when the first outreach staff was hired, the library's greater priority was "somebody who speaks Spanish" (Informant). For many years, 'Spanish-speaking' or 'bilingual' was often listed as part of the job description or requirements. It appears there was a bilingual reference librarian hired for the Lincoln Park Branch in 2001; and again in 2004. Although in a 2006 report, the key focus of outreach's job description was "trying to find the means and methods to reach those communities where there's less familiarity with libraries and library services to people"—one can assume that Spanish was the means to reach the non-traditional communities mentioned (Marks, 2006, p.29). However, Human Resources' (HR) answers in 2007 to the supplemental questions for the self-assessment checklist clarify the lack of initiative in hiring bilingual staff. When asked how many bilingual staff WLD had at the time, HR did not know; and when asked if they recruited Spanish-speaking staff, HR responded, "[t]hey find us" (Informant, Personal Correspondence, 2007). When asked if job openings were posted in media sources specific to the Hispanic community, offered incentives for "language training" or to bilingual hires, HR responded negatively (Informant, Personal Correspondence, 2007). However, as noted before, an additional bilingual and bicultural outreach staff was hired in 2009.

Around 2013, the generalist movement led the library to change their objectives; they wanted "everyone more generalized, so they took away the job descriptions" (Informant). Within the generalist movement, immigrant services should be capable of working in the children's collection, and vice versa; similarly, even though Spanish-speaking may be a priority, a Spanish-speaker isn't who is necessarily hired. As outreach stated, on many occasions "it would be great to have a Spanish speaker, but it doesn't seem to be a major qualification when the hiring actually begins" (Informant). While at one point, Lincoln Park Branch had three bilingual staff, they were three of eighteen in a neighborhood that was close to 50% Hispanic. After two left, no bilingual Spanish-English staff were hired to replace either, but rather someone who reportedly spoke 'Pirate' (Informant). Fortunately, over the course of 2017 in response to the needs of the surrounding communities, various new bilingual and bicultural staff were hired.

Despite HR's negative responses to the survey in 2007, there was an effort in 2005 to teach staff Spanish specific to the library profession. Although those efforts ended, they were taken back up around 2015. As of January 2017, the Spanish classes were still being offered. On Thursday afternoons, interested staff goes to the district office for Spanish classes; they last ten to twelve weeks and are taught by a former UNC Professor (Informants). While the interest of some staff in learning Spanish contrasts with those who resist helping Spanish-speaking patrons, outreach emphasized that the library profession is a service profession; you "deal with the public and the public brings uncomfortable things"—communication and cultural competency is one of their professional obligations (Informant).

One factor that has impacted Spanish-language initiatives in the past decade is the shifting demographics. While the nature of the services—bilingual or Spanish-language—to Spanish-speaking families used to be "lumped into one", the influx of other language groups has

led them to "separate those two out" (Informant). While the Spanish—speaking population continues to grow, the refugee population does also. Notwithstanding, the question of providing services to other language groups in their primary language appears to have been unsuccessful beyond a video in Burmese on the general services that HPLD offers. Outreach was told by the administration that each other language group needed to reach ten percent before their needs would be addressed beyond services and marketing in English. However, outreach highlighted that it was unclear if the ten percent referred to those who enter the library, or Greeley or Weld County's population—language data could feasibly be gathered from the library card applications but is not.

Additionally, even if HPLD did want to provide further services in other languages, many of the partnering organizations, for example, IRC, require all programs to be in English, even though the target audience may not yet speak or read it. Because IRC merged in 2017 with Right to Read of Weld County, and Right to Read receives federal funding from the Adult Ed and Family Leave Act, the services and programs are limited to English.

The library card application reflects the challenges and debate over services both in Spanish and in other languages. Before, the Spanish version of the library card application both differed from the English version and wasn't culturally adapted; it has since been revised. The general application now includes a choice between English or Spanish as the primary language, but only a line for 'other' is included for primary languages beyond English or Spanish. Outreach commented that while one librarian does encourage people to include their primary language, other staff get angry with her for doing so.

The purpose of tracking other primary languages is to gather statistics on what language groups are served by the library; however, tracking this data was met with resistance. Outreach

was told that High Plains "can't support that in the database" (Informant). For the same reason, there's "no way for [them] to inform the district that [they] have other people speaking other languages"; without the statistics outreach can't prove the need for specific services or resources (Informant). Outreach concluded that this is "the way we keep our head in the sand" (Informant).

Outreach also finds itself challenging the assumption that since many people coming from other language groups are low-literacy, that there is no need to translate any program flyers or brochures since "they can't read it" (Informant). However, "[other departments] miss again the idea that when [people] see their language represented, even if they can't read it, they understand that it makes them feel more welcome," in addition to being able to take the flyer to an interested family member (Informant). For the same reason, branch libraries apparently made "contraband" translations to ensure families would know about relevant branch library programming, and one bilingual librarian in particular would also attend community events to announce services and programming (Informant). The ignorance—in the literal meaning of the word, not knowing—regarding outreach's needs becomes detrimental to the concept of the library being a democratic institution for everyone. In the meantime, as outreach points out, the library is "going to lose a lot of patrons" (Informant).

In addition to the various rationales outreach hears when asked to justify their needs, they highlighted one main inconsistency: a lot of general programming includes "pay[ing] other people to come into our library" (Informant). For the same reason, outreach questions "why can't we pay someone else who speaks Spanish to come in and do a program?" (Informant). For outreach, this contradiction leads them to question the possible prejudices underlying the overall resistance to providing services in a language other than English and to non-traditional users.

As it is, outreach reported that at some branches there is resistance to offering even bilingual storytimes. Staff will state they don't know Spanish, despite that many of the storytimes are for toddlers and the board books, "with one word on each page," are easy to translate (Informant). Offering to guide them has been equally fruitless—"they just want me (as a bilingual and bicultural staff member) to do it for them" (Informant). Outreach clarified that this resistance by some staff contributes to the lack of in-house Spanish-language initiatives and the exclusion of Spanish-speakers at general programming.

As stated earlier, outreach clarified that the attitudes toward a language other than English expressed by library staff often times reflect "the larger... social dynamic" (Informant). The prevailing attitude that "English [i]s the language" reflects prejudices against immigrants and minorities, and bilingualism and multilingualism (Informant). These prejudices are illustrated by a personal experience one of the informants shared. The informant had posted on Facebook a quote that promotes bi- and multilingualism: it stated, "'Freedom of speech not only protects what you say but [also]... the language you choose to say it in" (Informant). As the Informant stated—"people went crazy". Most were indignified by the idea that language "is a choice we can make" and that the first amendment applies to languages, cultures and people in the U.S. beyond English, Anglo and white.

Outreach informants clarified that the reduced size of outreach and the limited number of Spanish-speaking staff during the early 2000's impacted the ability to publicize their Spanish-language programs and services to their target audience. Outreach did the translations after hours in addition to regular afterhours work. As highlighted previously, outreach began advocating in 2009 for a translation committee; the resulting team was comprised by outreach and bilingual

library staff during the first years. Currently, only the translation team translates, and translation is the only responsibility of the translation team.

As noted previously, a service brochure was translated by staff at some point prior to 2001; otherwise, the first translations outreach completed was of material to "promote computer labs and computer services to Spanish speakers" for the recently established Gates Computer Labs (Informant). Similarly, despite a parent asking for the reading logs to be offered in Spanish in 2000, for many years the only summer reading material apparently translated was promotional material, beyond the reading log and program calendar cover in 2003, signage when the LPB was renovated in 2004, and program calendars from 2004 and 2005. Program calendars from subsequent years were not included in the archives. And although bilingual story times were included in the programming, "none of the [individual] programs, or program descriptions, were in Spanish"; they were not consistently translated to Spanish until 2010.

Despite the success in forming a translation team, PIO has continued to exercise much control over the marketing and publicity of programs and services, both within general programming and through outreach. They decide what programs can be marketed in Spanish or not, but often in ways that both undermine outreach's efforts, and express the prejudices that underlie the decision-making process. As outreach commented, PIO's most frequent response tends to be, "'what's the need? Those people never come...it's a waste of our money..."

(Informant).

In 2007, outreach sent PIO supplemental questions to expand on the results of the self-assessment checklist. PIO's response to the questions create an unclear understanding of their efforts to market to Spanish-speaking populations up to this time. While the responding PIO staff affirms translating "the District's major communication pieces and oth[e]r misc event

information," no statistics, percentages, nor dollar amounts are provided regarding PIO's budget for translations when asked "what percentage of PSAs are issued in Spanish" or "sent out [...] to Spanish-language media". Likewise, when asked if PIO had ever assessed the impact and consumability of the Spanish-language "marketing campaigns," PIO clarified that "the District [had] never done a marketing campaign in Spanish" (Informant, Personal Correspondence, 2007).

Other translations that have been completed, beyond service and program brochures and guides to using the Dewey Decimal system, include a nursery rhyme book and the early literacy tip cards for SPELL and the additional service flyer for the bookmobile provided to Head Start parents—it is in both English and Spanish and includes a picture of the librarian, a list of the books the children read and early literacy tips.

In many ways, both the loss of the Spanish-language interface of HPLD's website in 2016 and the conflict over the Summer Reading Poster and Program Calendar that same year illustrates for outreach the obstacles in marketing, and therefore, sustaining their efforts. Getting translations, and translations that are actually "consumable by the Spanish-speaking public here in this area," completed is often a struggle (Informant). In addition to the consumability of the actual translation, translations of promotional and other material were frequently printed on paper stock while the English version was printed on "very shiny, bright, heavy stock," creating a notable difference in quality (Informant). It was only until 2016 that this difference was resolved, by downgrading the English version to paper stock.

In 2016, the SRP poster and program calendar was translated and a bilingual version was printed "without any special requests" by outreach; the SRP special committee had requested the

<sup>10</sup> Exceptions to this include the bilingual program calendars from 2004 and 2005 found in the archives.

79

translation (Informant). However, the final product provoked "a big backlash" because PIO had omitted the background image to make room for the text (Informant). PIO was adamant that it wouldn't work any other way because of the excess text, and that they had not asked for input from outreach due to the increased workload. Fortunately, the 2017 program calendar was again translated and the issues from 2016 were resolved—the image was reintegrated to maintain the poster's appeal to children; it appears that the poster will now be automatically translated.

Currently, all other material has to be requested to be translated. The request must be justified as necessary and relevant, and approved by PIO or the external funding source. For example, in January 2017, outreach mentioned wanting to translate the nursery rhyme book to Somali, Burmese or Karini to use in programming, so they applied for a grant for the same. But by October 2017, the request had been "shot down due to the low literacy of the population we were targeting [...] the grant was denied because they felt that a book would not meet the needs of the population" (Informant). Since no other possible sources of funding appeared to exist, the translation could not be realized.

Challenges and obstacles. Outreach explained that within the HPLD, which is property-tax funded, the district initially receives the tax money. The district keeps a third of each member library's money for purchasing, processing and IT; the remaining two-thirds designated for a specific library is then returned to them. The HPLD board is beholden to represent the member libraries and their interests.

Beyond taxes, one main source of funding for library initiatives at HPLD is grant funding through the Grants to States Program—grants that the Colorado State Library receives through the Institute of Museum and Library Services (IMLS). This is distributed by the State Library as Library Services and Technology Act (LSTA) grants to individual libraries and library districts;

many libraries depend on LSTA grants for implementing new services and initiatives. <sup>11</sup> High Plains has used LSTA grants for citizenship classes, PCCs, and other outreach initiatives. The rotating Spanish-language collection that operated in 2003 was also funded through an LSTA grant.

Outreach explained that LSTA grants do not have restrictions concerning the language in which the initiative is implemented as "The American Dream Starts at Your Library" does; however, they do require that the program or service to be funded be sustainable. All three informants emphasized that within the district, PIO plays a large role in what initiatives get implemented and marketed to Spanish-speaking families and communities; if outreach is unable to justify marketing a program in Spanish to PIO, the initiative will not likely be successful—without a public campaign, few initiatives will draw enough audience to make them viable, and therefore, sustainable. They stated that without taking the restrictions of funding into consideration, it's easy to assume that "those on the front lines" are responsible for what does or doesn't happen in a library (Informant). But in recognizing that funding and marketing outreach initiatives are often determined or "driven by other people, other decisions, other needs; outreach, just as librarians, may often have little control over what is implemented and marketed to non-traditional users (Informant).

Additionally, before the reorganization at HPLD, the size of the project or program determined where along the hierarchy outreach and branch librarians needed permission from to be approved for funding—bilingual storytimes at Head Start do not require approval. Although they initially requested permission from the Associate Director to pursue initiatives, if the project were larger, it required proposing it to the Director or Foundation. However, since the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> For more information on LSTA grants, see http://www.cde.state.co.us/cdelib/LSTA/.

reorganization and outreach's merging with PIO, the process has been formalized for all initiatives and activities pursued by outreach. PIO has only gained greater control and oversight over outreach; outreach clarified that they lost any autonomy they may have previously had.

Outreach further explained that PIO is coming from a marketing perspective; it is not a service profession perspective, nor a perspective focused on community building and cohesion. Informants clarified during the second interviews that despite the merger of outreach and PIO merging under community engagement, PIO's understanding had not expanded. PIO may justify their actions as aimed at ensuring funding is used effectively, but the feeling is that PIO is "very selective about which programs they scrutinize and which programs they don't scrutinize," even more so since PIO is the department with greatest access to information on Greeley and Weld County's demographics.

In coming from a marketing perspective, PIO believes that spending a dollar per person either in attendance at a program or receiving a service is too much; PIO "like[s] the programs where [...] 30 dollars [can] reach 50 people. Or sixty people...they are 100% about the dollar" (Informant). Outreach's experience has been that the focus on "dollars and cents" roadblocks "building trust and [...] showing Spanish language populations that the library is a place for them" (Informant). Outreach costs more because "it takes more to take the library out [...] because of time, space, distance, traveling, trying to reach beyond those boundaries," but PIO, in being trained only in "marketing and promotion," consistently dismisses the nature of service professions, which depend on "a high number of positive contact and interactions before [they] start seeing results" (Informant). PIO fails to support outreach in a way that allows it to be fully effective and successful.

Minorities in the United States already experience social exclusion; as outreach pointed out, this exclusion increases for immigrant minorities and even more so if they speak a language other than English. In addition, the current anti-immigrant political climate in the U.S., in Colorado, and more specifically, in Weld County, erodes even further the trust of Spanish-speaking families, individuals and immigrants<sup>12</sup>. It is logical for Spanish-speaking families and individuals to mistrust the library and assume it will "represent the larger...social dynamic..." (Informant).

Because of the political climate and in recognizing that the library is a government institution, many in the Hispanic community assume there is "some kind of price attached" to receiving services (Informant). This results in an additional barrier of mistrust. The barriers subsequently prevent Hispanic families and individuals from taking advantage of what the library has to offer them.

Additionally, outreach noted that the request for personal identification, a physical address and phone number when applying for a library card—and saving this information on the computer—creates apprehension among many immigrants who may be or have family members who are undocumented. So even though bilingual and bicultural staff may serve as a welcoming presence that signals inclusion, they are still seen as employees of a government institution; they still have to invest time in building trust. However, outreach's goal is to "break down those [political, linguistic, racial, and cultural] barriers"—the barriers that have led them to actually say to Hispanic patrons, "just because you're not white, [it] doesn't mean you don't deserve this

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Weld County is part of Colorado's 4<sup>th</sup> Congressional District. The district's representative, Ken Buck, was responsible for the ICE raids on Swift & Co. in 2006 and on Amalia's Translation and Tax Service in 2009, in which customers' confidential tax information was confiscated. See https://www.thenation.com/article/anti-immigrant-zealot-becomes-gops-colorado-senate-nominee/.

as well" (Informant). But also, the barriers that lead PIO to respond, "what's the need? Those people never come...it's a waste of our money..." (Informant).

### CHAPTER 5 – IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In striving to become a third space and to foster community cohesion, it is imperative for libraries to avoid creating "a place where [some] people see a reflection of their own [dominant] culture even as they get access to a wider one" but others see a space that only offers token representations of their language, culture and race, or none at all (Harris & Dudley, 2005, p.13). For the same reason, in striving to draw Hispanic families and individuals to the library as users, the library must ensure modeling cohesion and inclusive practices within the library itself. It is apparently easy for a library to depend on outreach to represent inclusive practices—to offer services, programs and resources to Hispanic communities, but off-site. However, this only risks creating a "narrative [...of] goodwill [that] can obscure one of the most basic truths of institutional racism in the 21st century: It is most present and powerful where it is unnamed and unaddressed" (Sonnie, 2017, p. 41). However, attempting to maintain the space of the library as predominantly homogenous, of not naming or addressing the racism underlying the homogeneity "is both unrealistic and probably undesirable" (Harris & Dudley, 2005, p.13); the library itself, in serving the community, should represent the community. As Atlestam and Myhre (2014) state, "[t]he most important thing is to maximize the possibilities and to communicate over all 'cultural boundaries', to create as huge a cultural and social interface as possible, to strive for the widest interculturalism [and interlingualism]" (p.10).

Achieving "the widest interculturalism [and interlingualism]" within the localized context of this present study can only occur if and when the political, linguistic, racial and cultural barriers that prevent communities from using and being involved with the local libraries are understood and broken down. Within a localized context whose Hispanic population has

historically been an economic, cultural and social mainstay of the community, committing to inclusive practices communicates that the library truly is for everyone—that you don't have to be white nor speak English—to "see yourself at the library" (Bias-Elliott, 2006, p.1)

As stated in the introduction, while a library does need to resolve administrative and other obstacles that might prevent it from fully welcoming, representing and serving Spanish-speaking families and individuals, it is only in taking the step to do so that the obstacles can be resolved. It is important to first make the changes that can be made most easily: to create an environment with more books, signage and collections relevant to Hispanic communities on the shelves, walls, end caps, in general programming, and on the website. Other internal administrative changes that demonstrate not just token acts but institutional change, can be subsequently planned, developed and implemented.

In what follows, five recommendations are provided which focus on promoting the library in Spanish; creating a committee to guide and ensure the district's commitment to Hispanic communities and equity in general; community analyses; intercultural competency training for all staff and administration; and inclusive hiring practices and representation on the library board. While these recommendations are not from a library specialist, I believe that they clarify what is apparent from the outside, and from interviews with those of intimate knowledge of the library system in Colorado and research about that system: an urgent need for an invested and cohesive effort by administration in response to Hispanic families' and individuals' needs—in short, to support the efforts and commitment of outreach and bilingual and bicultural librarians to serve the district's Hispanic communities.

# Recommendation One: Ensure Access in Spanish to the Website and Programming Flyers.

The need for a Spanish-language version of the HPLD website was recently illustrated by my attempt to help someone living in downtown Greeley locate ESL classes nearby. He does not have a car and the IRC where ESL classes were offered had moved from downtown Greeley to Evans, CO. Since 2016, the website has only been available in English beyond a welcome page in Spanish, '!Mi Biblioteca', located under "Newcomers," which is located in the dropdown menu for "Services". However, most of the links included on the Spanish-language welcome page for further services lead to pages in English; similarly, the descriptions of ESL classes on the calendar of events are in English. And while the catalog provides a Spanish-language setting, the user needs to be familiar with English and computers to locate the catalog on the website and access the language setting. Experiencing the webpage from this individual's perspective clarified how not providing a Spanish-language version of the website communicates who the library strives to draw in and who it filters out. Filtering potential patrons out, inadvertently or not, is how the library, as outreach stated, "keep[s its] head in the sand" (Informant).

Similarly, it is important for the library to offer Spanish-language program flyers of all general and special programming. As stated in the findings, while Spanish-language flyers have been made of general services, they are not made of programming except upon request that is approved. In contrast, by 2013, JBS S.A. had translated the employee handbook from English to three additional languages (UC Davis, "Meat and Migrants," 2013); and staff at Saint Paul Public Library completed translations of four children's books into their native languages (Hmong and Oromo), and have plans for more.

The Migration Policy Institute (MPI) recommends considering forming a "volunteer language bank made up of bilingual staff" (MPI, 2018, n.p.); such a language bank could also

include interested members of the community. To ensure the quality of the translations, training can be provided to the volunteer translators, as New York City (NYC) has done through their program NYCertified for bilingual city employees. The language bank can then be kept of volunteers and staff who have completed the training. MPI's initiative, "Language Access: Translation and Interpretation Policies and Practices," also offers other resources related to "ensuring translation quality" and on multilingual websites (MPI, 2018). To facilitate the actual translation process, templates and a stock of relevant idiomatic expressions and vocabulary can be created of programming based on event type. And to cover translation costs in serving immigrant communities, USCIS and IMLS (2010), recommend including immigrant services as a budget item; the budget item should be inclusive of translations, to ensure consistency in advertising programming to "the widest intercultural [...]" audience possible (Atlestam & Myhre, 2014, p.10).

The Spanish-language programming flyers can be shared at outreach events and programs, posted at key commercial, educational and social points, and announced by collaborating agencies at community meetings that the target audience attends. The ALA's (2004) "Manual para promotores de bibliotecas" can be used to guide the diffusion.

Recommended and best practices for library services to Latinos repeatedly emphasize "not underestimate[ing] the little things and [...] not assum[ing] the Hispanic community does not take notice"; translating the HPLD portal as well as all programming flyers are one of "the little things" (Rosales, 2016, para. 11).

### **Recommendation Two: Create a Hispanic Steering Committee.**

When the DPL decided in the late 1980's and early 1990's to make a change and create a library inclusive of Denver's Hispanic community, one of the first steps they took was to create a

Hispanic Steering Committee (HSC). The HSC, which began with 3 people, soon consisted of four task forces—public relations, services with children and youth, collections, and outreach. It served a multi-faceted purpose of, first, addressing the issue overall; second, of providing the administration with the statistics to illustrate the need for change; and to present formal proposals for initiatives to the administration that related to the specific needs evidenced by the statistics. Likewise, the HSC also served to hold the administration accountable to support the effort and necessary changes. As the informant stated, "my assumption is that the reason we [...] succeeded is because we had a committee" (Informant). Although the HSC at the DPL has since ended due to a change in administration and its priorities, the more integral change that did occur at the DPL was due to the cohesive efforts that a steering committee allows for.

In reading through the meeting minutes of the HPLD's Latino Work Team (LWT), it is clear that the team that originally formed in 2006 did so with the same goals in mind. Specifically, the LWT aimed to "tailor [their] programming and promotional ideas" to the needs of the Latino Communities in the WLD service areas" and their objectives included in particular to "propose marketing strategies, provide and/or proof translations and represent the district at venues/functions that draw Latino populations" ("A Proposal for Latino Services", 2006).

In creating a Work Team inclusive of focused task forces, it would allow for an integral effort that both supports outreach and also involves the district in ensuring that relevant branches and programming are fully representational of Weld County's Hispanic population. The Government Alliance on Race and Equity's (GARE) (Sonnie, 2017) "Advancing Racial Equity in Public Libraries" clarifies how central a focused team is to successfully guide the library through the institutional changes; the framework, tool-kit and how-to manual published by GARE can be used to guarantee an integrated effort. And just as a committee can ensure the

administration is fully informed of the statistics, the needs they correspond to and the ways in which those needs can be met, they can hold the administration accountable to support the same efforts. Just as Sonnie (2017) recommends for Equity teams, the HSC and any related task groups can include community leaders and members, members from partnering agencies, and administrative staff, thereby involving multiple stakeholders in a collaborative and inclusive effort.

## **Recommendation Three: Conduct Regular Community Analyses**

Sarling and Van Tassel (1999) quote Mary Cutler (1896) in "Community Analysis: Research that Matters to a North-Central Denver Community," stating that a librarian is to "be a careful student of his own town...that he may [...] open up new avenues of communication between the library and the people" (p.7). They similarly quote Charles Williamson (1919), stating that "'no more important responsibility rests upon library administrators and trustees than this duty of understanding clearly all the library needs of the community" (p.7-8). Sarling and Van Tassel's (1999) emphasis on community analyses is likewise reiterated by Atlestam and Myhre (2014), in their description of a multilingual library in Goteberg, Sweden—they affirm that "it's really only in direct contact with local residents that you find out what they wish for and aspire to"—that you find out why "[t]hose people never come" (Atlestam & Myhre, 2014, p.8; Informant). Madison Public Library, as part of their own racial equity initiative, created "Tell Us," a tool that allows "everyone to join the conversation to help [them] get to know [their] community better". The tool, handout with instructions, suggestions, guiding discussion questions and space to record participants' answers, serves to supplement community analyses. The discussions are meant to be held in familiar settings among small groups of community members.

The community analysis that Sarling and Van Tassel (1999) performed was multi-faceted. They identified the service area; walked and drove around the area and made drop-in visits; identified transportation routes and prevailing daily work schedules; established the demographics from census reports, newspaper articles and interviews; identified formal and informal community groups to interview; identified any agencies or organizations serving the community; and identified any media sources serving the community. They interviewed neighborhood associations, non-profit and community organizations, religious and political groups, social services and businesses, among other relevant people and groups (Sarling & Van Tassel, 1999, p.11). The data collected was subsequently analyzed and coded to understand the factors influencing the needs.

Their goal was to develop an understanding of the community's needs from more than one perspective, in knowing that any "conclusions and recommendations [must] emerge from data rather than opinion alone" when determining how to meet the needs of surrounding communities (Sarling & Van Tassel, 1999, p.9). Although in this specific case, the findings were to support the construction of a new branch library, the authors emphasize that "the process [of community analyses] should be ongoing" and they conclude with recommendations:

the library staff conduct the community analysis [...]; [that] as many stakeholders as possible [are involved]; [...] that the researcher begins to know the community as her own, to be interested in the lives of its residents and to become an advocate for the needs of the community;[...] [that] the relationships that develop during a community analysis lead to trust and support of the library. (Sarling & Van Tassel, 1999, p. 26)

By including the library as a stakeholder in the community analysis, there is opportunity to identify what support minority staff need to retain them, and what professional development and intercultural competency training all staff need to create a *third space*. Just as ensuring a fully representational space should be an integral part of a public library's identity, community

analyses should be "as basic to library management as the physician's diagnosis is to the practice of medicine" (as cited in Sarling & Van Tassel, 1999, p. 8).

## **Recommendation Four: Provide Intercultural Sensitivity Training.**

As stated in the third recommendation, one facet of the community analysis is to identify the needs of library staff in creating a fully representational space. When English-monolingual staff refuse to offer bilingual storytime to toddlers, it illustrates a privileged stance in relation to professional obligations, which contrasts with expecting patrons to navigate an English-language portal to locate ESL classes and bilingual storytimes. While it may be "extremely challenging to change the attitudes of [...] an entire public library's culture," it is imperative to still strive to do so "at every level of the organization" (Gould, 2015, n.p.).

There are many resources available that can support libraries in developing and practicing intercultural competency. For example, the website *New Models for Intercultural Library*Services (www.librariesforall.eu) can serve as a reference, resource and as a contact list for support, suggestions and advice specific to orientation for staff in providing intercultural library services. Library Consultant Cheryl Gould provides workshops for library staff on creating "a facilitative mindset" and other resources on her website *Fully Engaged Libraries*. Gould aids library staff in deconstructing biases that lead them to "make [themselves as] more important than [their] customer" (Gould, 2015, n.p.). The workshops' thematic focus ranges from leadership development for libraries, communication and engaged customer service to confronting biases and developing creativity.

A further resource, "Inclusive Outreach and Public Engagement Guide," developed by the Seattle Office for Civil Rights (2009) for the Race and Social Justice Initiative, was created as a "practical guide and resource for all City Staff" (p.3). The guide includes strategies, an overview of components of "inclusive engagement," a worksheet, matrix of "types of engagement" and a template to assess the process and outcomes. It includes a cultural competence continuum with examples of each stage, and the process specifically focuses on staff recognizing who benefits and who is marginalized by their decisions and practices.

In "Advancing Racial Equity in Public Libraries," (Sonnie, 2017) there are multiple case studies that illustrate the professional development and intercultural competency training that each library created for its staff. In all cases, the focus was on recognizing personal, institutional and structural racism, and the upper administrative levels and all management received in-depth training. At San Antonio Public Library, they "analyze[d] case studies, discuss[ed] implicit and explicit bias, and identif[ied] examples of individual, institutional and structural racism" (Sonnie, 2017, p.19). And whereas at Oakland Public Library, they created an equity team and used surveys to identify the "research, training and action" needs of staff, at Seattle Public Library (SPL), they identified the necessary competencies specific to staff, the equity team, and management, to focus training on those competencies (p.19). The GARE resource includes links to relevant resources created by each library, such as SPL's "Racial Equity Toolkit to Assess Policies, Initiatives, Programs and Budget Issues" which can be used to guide staff in reflecting on how their policies and practices benefit or burden minorities and marginalized populations. While intercultural competency training is time consuming for libraries with a limited budget, it is an imperative for the library to avoid "spend[ing] more time dealing with resistance than idea generation [...]" (Gould, 2015, n.p.).

## Recommendation Five: Invite Hispanic Community Members to Library Staff and Board.

As stated in the intro and the fourth recommendation, to create a *third space*, the library can no longer operate from a "permanent privileged center" (Elmborg, 2011, p. 344). However,

as was evident in the interviews, this shift has not yet occurred and is often met with resistance. For the same reason, in addition to understanding the roots of the lack of diversity in the library profession in general, management itself, in pushing for more bilingual and bicultural staff, "must set, enforce, promote, and model policies that reinforce inclusion and value diversity at every level of the library organization" (Larsen, 2017, n.p.). It is not enough for administration to hire bilingual and bicultural support staff; the administration and library board need to reflect just as fully the linguistic and cultural communities that the library serves.

Sonnie (2017) recommends that the "Library workforce (both staff and management) reflects or exceeds the racial demographics of the community" and that the library critically evaluate their hiring practices to eliminate barriers; employ "representative/diverse hiring panels, including community members"; create ways for staff to give feedback and protocol to address discriminatory conduct; and create "pathways to full-time work/benefits," and to training and obtaining library credentials and related degrees (p.37).

The findings of Flores and Pachon's (2008) study "Latinos and Public Library Perceptions" highlighted the correlation of bilingual staff and "Latinos' positive perceptions of and satisfaction with public libraries" (p. 9). While Ayala and Guereña (2012) emphasize that the recruitment of Latino librarians needs to begin within the MLIS programs, Larsen (2017) describes the Urban Library Program (ULP), a collaborative program between St. Catherine University and Saint Paul Public Library, that focuses on recruiting library staff based on "their [cultural] competencies" (n.p.). While the individuals recruited "would not have otherwise considered working in public libraries" and they were hired for paraprofessional positions, they were mentored, given professional development opportunities and experiential practice (Larsen, 2017, n.p.). Many continued their studies and career in library information sciences.

Similarly, when the Valdez-Perry Library—the focus of the study on Community

Analysis—opened in the mid-1990's in Denver, there was a concerted effort to recruit staff with a personal investment in the neighborhood. Grants were offered to youth to work as library assistants, and volunteers for other programs were also recruited from the community. Just as the ULP, the effort to hire individuals from the neighborhood led to many of those same individuals to "see the Library as a potential career" (Sarling & Van Tassel, 1999, p.26).

Such efforts are emphasized in the USCIS and IMLS (2010) report mentioned earlier; they recommend providing "internships to immigrants with skills that might help the program[s]" as well as "recruit[ing] immigrants to serve on the library board" and on "advisory councils or working groups" (pp.2-6). They also reflect MPL's initiative to invite "local leaders of color with expertise in event planning, business and community development" to submit proposals for library programming for non-traditional users; the "participants receive [...] stipends, mentorship and a programming budget to produce their own programs" (Sonnie, 2017, p.34). As Larsen (2017) states, if public libraries "serve as forums for equal access to information for diverse communities, [they] need to be more active in initiatives to diversify their workforces [...] staff of all levels in the library have a part to play" (n.p.).

### CHAPTER 6 – CONCLUSION

As detailed in the background of this study, the U.S. has a rich multilingual and multicultural history. A large part of this history is Hispanic, and Colorado's history reflects this Hispanic heritage. Likewise, Colorado's current Hispanic communities create of the state a microcosm of the U.S.'s overall current bilingual and bicultural reality—the number of Spanish speakers in the U.S. make it second worldwide—it currently has more Spanish speakers than Spain (Burgen, 2015). In light of this bilingual reality, and of Colorado as a microcosm of it, it is of value for public libraries in Colorado to model not just inclusiveness, but also of dismantling the "permanent privileged center" that truncates the same aim (Elmborg, 2011, p. 344).

But even more so, in light of the current discriminatory attitudes toward immigrants and Hispanics nationwide, and the equally historical function of libraries as "racially segregated facilities" and of librarianship as a "white profession," investing time, effort and thought in transforming libraries is imperative (Sonnie, 2017, p.10; Espinal, 2001, p.133). As Sonnie (2017) cites Prescott (2017), author of *Topographies of Whiteness: Mapping Whiteness in Library and Information Science*, "White librarians need to develop anti-racist analysis and apply it to librarianship, confront white privilege in its multiple manifestations, and work in alliance with librarians of color to dismantle racism" (p.11). Analyzing their practices and the underlying beliefs that support them will help uproot what Espinal (2001) describes as the "things of racial significance [that are] made to seem fair, just, legitimate, and simplistically obvious when the embodied experiences of racial targets scream that they clearly are not" (p. 136.).

The library must ensure that it truly is for everyone. For the same reason, the perspective apparently at play in the HPLD and unchallenged by the administration, of asking outreach why

they are marketing "to people who probably aren't going to come" and focusing only on "effective use of [their] marketing money" (Informant) defies logic and the very purpose of beginning outreach in 2001—to draw the Hispanic community to the library to ensure the library's viability and presence for everyone.

While the recommendations made are the outcomes of looking specifically at one library district and its historical and current Hispanic communities and population, they reiterate those made repeatedly over past decades—by Latinos with expertise in library service, Library Associations, the Colorado State Library, GARE, and USCIS and IMLS (2010), among others. For the same reason, outreach's statement that the HPLD needs "more Latino stuff" inclusive of books, signage, staff and "collections that truly reflect our populations" reiterates from a personal standpoint (Informant), what research shows: change is needed to make of the library a model of inclusive community cohesion. And in taking the steps to model and sustain inclusive community cohesion—both linguistically and culturally—the district will set a precedent for all surrounding communities.

While change can be difficult, the challenges mostly stem from resistance to uprooting oneself from the "privileged center" (Elmborg, 2011, p. 344); notwithstanding, what it mainly requires is making a decision, and making change an "institutional priority" (Sonnie, 2017, p.14). As highlighted in the introduction, change will not occur by waiting for the challenges to be resolved but rather by taking the first step to resolve them.

### REFERENCES

- Aabo, S. & Audunson, R. (2012). Use of library space and the library as space. *Library & Information Science Research*, *34*, p.138-149. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lisr.2011.06.002
- Adams, D.W. (1995). Education for extinction: American Indians and the boarding school experience, 1875-1928. Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas.
- Adams, K. (1975, December). Toward a bilingual library. *Colorado Libraries*. Colorado Library Commission, pp. 8-11.
- American Library Association. (2004). Manual para promotores de bibliotecas. Library Advocacy Now. American Library Association. Retrieved from http://www.ala.org/aboutala/sites/ala.org.aboutala/files/content/ola/manual\_biblio\_final.pdf
- American Library Association. (1996-2017). Interpretations of the *Bill of Rights*. American Library Association. Retrieved from http://www.ala.org/advocacy/sites/ala.org.advocacy/files/content/LBORwithInterpretations2017.pdf
- American Library Association. (1996). *Bill of Rights*. American Library Association. Retrieved from http://www.ala.org/advocacy/sites/ala.org.advocacy/files/content/LBORwith Interpretations2017.pdf
- Anguori, J. (2013). The multilingual reality of the multinational workplace: Language policy and language use. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, *34* (6), 564-581. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2013.807273

- Associated Press (2005). Bilingual material in libraries draws some criticism. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2005/09/05/us/bilingual-material-in-libraries-draws-some-criticism.html?\_r=0
- Atlestam, I. and Myhre, R. (2014). Needs, reads and possibilities in a suburban library in a multicultural setting. Paper presented at: IFLA WLIC 2014 Lyon Libraries, Citizens, Societies: Confluence for Knowledge in Session 221 Library Services to Multicultural Populations. In: IFLA WLIC 2014, 16-22 August 2014, Lyon, France. Retrieved from http://library.ifla.org/851/
- Ayala, J. and Guereña, S. (Eds.). (2012). *Pathways to progress: Issues and advances in Latino librarianship*. Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, LLC.
- Barsch, T.M. (Compiler). (1977). *Colorado public libraries 1876-1976: Historical sketches*. Colorado State Library. Denver, CO: Colorado Department of Education.
- Bear, C. (2008, May 13). American Indian school a far cry from the past. Colorado Public Radio.

  NPR. Retrieved from http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=17645287
- Bezugloff, N.B. (1980, Fall). Library services to non-English language ethnic minorities in the United States. *Library Trends*, 29 (2). Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/2142/7144
- Bias-Elliott, C. (2006). See yourself at the library. Non-journal. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED493748.
- Blommaert, J., Collins, J., & Slembrouck, S. (2005). Spaces of multilingualism. *Language & Communication*, 25(3), 197-216. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langcom.2005.05.002
- Bourdieu, P. (1990). Editor's Introduction. *Language and symbolic power*. Ed. John B. Thompson. Cambridge, UK: Polity Pres. Retrieved from https://soth-alexanderstreet-

- com.ezproxy2.library.colostate.edu/cgi-bin/asp/philo/soth/documentidx.pl?& sourceid=S10023879
- Brown, A. and Lopez, M.H. (2015, March 17). Public libraries and Hispanics: Immigrant

  Hispanics use libraries less, but those who do appreciate them the most. Pew Research

  Center. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/2015/03/17/public-libraries-and-hispanics/
- Burgen, S. (2015, June 29). U.S. now has more Spanish speakers than Spain—only Mexico has more. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2015/jun/29/us-second-biggest-spanish-speaking-country.
- Burrola, R. (1975, January 1). *Casimiro Barela: A Case study of Chicano political history in Colorado*. Paper presented at National Association for Chicana and Chicano Studies Annual Conference: 1975: 3rd Annual Conference Perspectivas en Chicano Studies. Paper 4. Retrieved from http://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/naccs/1975/Proceedings/4.
- CAIRCO. (2005, October). Libraries and Spanish language materials at taxpayer expense.

  CAIRCO.org. Retrieved from http://www.cairco.org/book/export/html/276
- Campbell, H.C. (1980). Worldwide immigration and its relation to library services. *Library Trends*, 29 (2). p. 210. Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/2142/7146
- CBS News. (2012, May 22). 2010 Census missed 1.5 million minorities. CBS News. CBS

  Interactive Inc. Retrieved from http://www.cbsnews.com/news/2010-census-missed-15-million-minorities/.
- Colorado Department of Education and Institute of Museum and Library Services. (2016).

  Colorado Public Library Standards. Colorado State Library. Retrieved from

- http://www.colibrarystandards.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/ColoradoPublic LibraryStandards2016Final-1-4-17-JCM.pdf
- Central Intelligence Agency. (2018). The World factbook. Field listing: Languages. Central Intelligence Agency. Retrieved from https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2098.html
- CLA Bulletin. (1938, September). News notes. Colorado Library Association Bulletin, 6, p.31.
- Cohn, D. (2010, March 3). Census history: Counting Hispanics. Pew Research Center: Social and Demographic Trends. Retrieved from:
  - http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/2010/03/03/census-history-counting-hispanics-2/
- Collins, J. and Slembrouck, S. (2005). Editorial: Multilingualism and diasporic populations:

  Spatializing practices, institutional processes, and social hierarchies. *Language & Communication*, 25 (3) 189-195. Retrieved from

  https://www.sciencedirect.com/journal/language-and-communication/vol/25/issue/3
- Congress.gov. (2015). All bill information (Except Text) for H.R.2255 To make participation in the American Community Survey voluntary, except with respect to certain basic questions, and for other purposes. 114<sup>th</sup> Congress (2015-2016). Retrieved from https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/house-bill/2255/all-info.
- Crawford, J. (2000). At War with diversity: U.S. language policy in an age of anxiety. Buffalo, NY: Multilingual Matters, LTD.
- Cuesta, Y. (2012, March 12). Library self-assessment checklist. Serving Spanish speaking communities success checklist. OCLC Web Junction. Retrieved from http://www.webjunction.org/explore-topics/slo/materials.html

- Dain, P. (2000). *The New York Public Library: A Universe of knowledge*. New York: New York Public Library and Scala Publishers Limited.
- de Jong, E. J. (2011). Language policy in the United States. *Foundations for Multilingualism in Education*. Philadelphia, PA: Caslon Publishing.
- Denver Public Library. (n.d.). Library service to undocumented residents. Denver Public Library—Responses.
- Donato, R. (2007). *Mexicans and Hispanos in Colorado schools and communities, 1920-1960*.

  Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Edwards, J.B., Rauseo, M.S. & Unger, K.R. (2013, April 30). Community centered: 23 reasons why your library is the most important. *Public Libraries Online*. Public Library Association. Retrieved from http://publiclibrariesonline.org/2013/04/community-centered-23-reasons-why-your-library-is-the-most-important-place-in-town/
- Elmborg, J.K. (2011). Libraries as the spaces between us: Recognizing and valuing the third space. *Reference and User Services Quarterly*, 50 (4), pp.338-350. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/20865425
- Erard, M. (2012, January 14). Are we really monolingual? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/15/opinion/sunday/are-we-really-monolingual.html?\_r=0
- Escamilla, K., Shannon, S., Carlos, S., and Garcia, J. (2003, Fall). Breaking the code: Colorado's defeat of the anti-bilingual education initiative (Amendment 31). *Bilingual Research Journal*, 27 (3). Retrieved from http://nepc.colorado.edu/files/Report\_0.pdf
- Espinal, I. R. (2003, October 1). Wanted: Latino librarians. *Library Journal*. Retrieved from https://lj.libraryjournal.com/2003/10/careers/wanted-latino-librarians/#\_.

- Espinal, I. R. (2001). A New vocabulary for inclusive librarianship: Applying whiteness theory to our profession. Libraries Unlimited. Retrieved from https://works.bepress.com/isabel\_espinal/5/
- Fell, J. E. (2013). Ever more diversity: Race, ethnicity & immigration in Colorado. Colorado Humanities. Retrieved from http://www.coloradohumanities.org/.
- Finley, B. (2009, June 28). Somali refugees take up new roots in Greeley. *The Denver Post*.

  Retrieved from https://www.denverpost.com/2009/06/28/somali-refugees-take-up-new-roots-in-greeley/.
- Flores, E. and Pachon, H. (2008, September). Latinos and public library perceptions. Tomas

  Rivera Policy Institute. Retrieved from https://www.webjunction.org/content/dam/Web

  Junction/Documents/webJunction/213544usb\_wj\_latinos\_and\_public\_library\_perception
  s.pdf
- Fort Collins History Connection. (1996-2012). Sugar beets, streetcar suburbs, and the city beautiful, 1900-1919. Fort Collins History and Architecture. Retrieved from http://history.fcgov.com/contexts/sugar.php
- Goldstein, D. (2003, Summer). The Spirit of an age: Iowa public libraries and professional librarians as solutions to society's problems, 1890-1940. *Libraries & Culture*, 38 (3) pp. 214-235. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/25549103
- Goodykuntz, C. B. (1948). The people of Colorado. In L. R. Hafen, PhD (Ed.), *Colorado and its People: A Narrative and Topical History of the Centennial State.*, (Vol. II, pp. 77-120). New York, NY: Lewis Historical Publishing CO., INC.

- Gould, C. (2015, February 25). A Facilitative mindset: Five steps to a customer-service culture.

  \*Public Libraries Online\*. Retrieved from http://publiclibrariesonline.org/2015/02/a-facilitative-mindset-five-steps-to-a-customer-service-culture/.
- Great Western Sugar Company. (1924). Beet labor film. Retrieved from https://dspace.library.colostate.edu/handle/10217/31600.
- Green, S.S., A.M. (1913). The Public library movement in the United States 1853-1893: From 1876, reminiscences of the writer. Boston: The Boston Book Company
- Gutiérrez, D. (n.d.). An Historic overview of Latino immigration and the demographic transformation of the United States. American Latino Theme Study. *The Making of America*. National Park Service. Retrieved from https://www.nps.gov/heritageinitiatives/latino/latinothemestudy/immigration.htm
- Hackman, A. (2015, March 27). Greeley's Armando Silva highlights Hip-Hop Madness. *The Tribune*. Retrieved from https://www.greeleytribune.com/entertainment/activities-and-events/greeleys-armando-silva-highlights-hip-hop-madness/
- Harris, M. (1972). The Purpose of the American Public Library in historical perspective: A Revisionist interpretation. ERIC Clearinghouse on Library and Information Sciences. Retrieved from http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED071668.pdf
- Harris, K. and Dudley, M. (2005). Public Libraries and Community Cohesion. Developing

  Indicators. Museums, Libraries and Archives Council. Retrieved from http://www.local-level.org.uk/uploads/8/2/1/0/8210988/public\_libraries\_and\_community\_cohesion.pdf
- Hosokawa, B. (2005). *Colorado's Japanese Americans: From 1886 to the present*. Boulder, CO: University Press of Colorado.

- Iyengar, M. M. (2014). Not mere abstractions: Language policies and language ideologies in U.S. settler colonialism. *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education and Society*, *3* (2), 33-59. Retrieved from http://decolonization.org/index.php/des/article/view/19559.
- Jaeger, P.T., Bertot, J.C., Kodama, C.M, Katz, S.M., DeCoster, E.J. (2011). Describing and measuring the value of public libraries: The growth of the Internet and the evolution of library value. *First Monday, 16* (11). Retrieved from http://journals.uic.edu/ojs/index.php/fm/article/view/3765/3074
- Kissam, E. (2016, October 26). Overcoming the differential undercount of minorities and immigrants: A Proactive 2017 initiative for success in census 2020. WK Family Fund.

  Retrieved from https://www.gcir.org/sites/default/files/Census%202020
  Proactive%20Strategy%20in%202017.pdf
- Lamb, A. (2012-2016). The growth of public libraries. Modern Libraries: 1850 CE. History of Libraries. Retrieved from http://www.eduscapes.com/history/modern/1850.htm
- Larsen, S.E. (2017, December 7). Diversity in public libraries strategies for achieving a more representative workforce. *Public Libraries Online*. Retrieved from http://publiclibrariesonline.org/2017/12/diversity-in-public-libraries-strategies-for-achieving-a-more-representative-workforce/
- Latino Services Advisory Committee. (2007, February 9). Meeting minutes. Organizational meeting minutes. Weld Library District.
- Latino Services Work Team. (2006, September 20). A Proposal for Latino services. Meeting minutes. Weld Library District.
- Laughlin, S. (2006). Report on focus groups with Spanish Speakers in Colorado, Florida, Illinois, and New Mexico. WebJunction Spanish Language Outreach Project. Retrieved from

- http://www.webjunction.org/content/dam/WebJunction/Documents/webjunction/Spanish-Language-Outreach-Program-Focus-Group-Report.pdf
- Library of Congress. (2003). Treaty of peace, friendship, limits, and settlement with the Republic of Mexico. Treaty with the Republic of Mexico: February 2, 1848. Retrieved from http://memory.loc.gov/cgi-bin/ampage?collId=llsl&fileName=009/llsl009.db&recNum=975.
- Maeda, D. J. (2008, January 30). Enduring communities: Japanese Americans in Colorado.
  Enduring communities: The Japanese American experience in Arizona, Colorado, New Mexico, Texas, and Utah. Discover Nikkei: Japanese migrants and their descendants.
  Retrieved from http://www.discovernikkei.org/en/journal/2008/1/30/enduring-communities/.
- Marks, R. B. (2006, October). Early literacy programs and practices at Colorado public libraries.

  \*\*Library Research Service\*, p.29. Retrieved from https://www.lrs.org/closer-look-studies/early-literacy-programs-and-practices-at-colorado-public-libraries/
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research. A Guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- McWhorter, J. (2015, September 13). What Sarah Palin's 'Speak American' is all about. *CNN*.

  Cable News Network. Retrieved from https://www.cnn.com/2015/09/06/opinions/

  mcwhorter-palin-speak-american/index.html
- M.G.S. (2001, Fall). [At War with diversity: U.S. language policy in an age of anxiety by J. Crawford]. Immigration and Education. Harvard Educational Review, 71(3). Retrieved by http://hepg.org/her-home/issues/harvard-educational-review-volume-71-issue-3/herbooknote/at-war-with-diversity\_113

- Migration Policy Institute. (2018). Language access: Translation and interpretation policies and practices. Migration Policy Institute. Retrieved from https://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/language-access-translation-and-interpretation-policies-and-practices.
- Mora, F. (2000). Spanish settlement and Hispanic history of Denver and Colorado. Partnerships for Educating Children: El Alma de la Raza Curriculum and Teacher Training Project.

  Retrieved from http://etls.dpsk12.org/documents/Alma/units/SpanishSettlement.pdf
- Moreno, C. (2015, August 31). 9 outrageous things Donald Trump has said about Latinos.

  \*HuffPost.\* HuffPost Multicultural/ HPMG News. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/9-outrageous-things-donald-trump-has-said-about-latinos\_us\_55e483a1e4b0c818f618904b
- Moreno, M. (2015, August 4). Harmful myths about Latino/as from the racist lady at IHOP. 

  \*HuffPost.\* HuffPost Multicultural/ HPMG News. Retrieved from 

  http://www.huffingtonpost.com/marisel-moreno/ihop-racism\_b\_7928740.html
- Moye, D. (2016, August 8). Customers stiff waitress; write 'we only tip citizens' on receipt. *The Huffington Post*. Retrieved from http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/we-only-tip-citziens-receipt\_us\_57b62796e4b03d5136875a22.
- Mugane, J. (2005). Necrolinguistics: Linguistic death-in-life. *Du Bois Review*, 2(2), 159-186.

  Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/6964607/Du\_Bois\_Review\_Necrolinguistics
- National Center for Farmworker Health. (2009). Migrant and Seasonal Farmworker

  Demographics. NCFH. Retrieved from

  https://foodindustry.com/files/MigrantFarmerDemographics.pdf

- Nutter, A. (1930). Delta Public Library, Anna Nutter, Librarian. *Colorado Libraries*, 4 (6), p. 101-102.
- Nutter, A. (1928). Delta Public Library, Anna Nutter, Libn. Colorado Libraries, 4 (2), p. 25.
- Ortega, L. (2014). Ways forward for a bi/multilingual turn in SLA. In S. May (Ed.), *The Multilingual Turn: Implications for SLA, TESOL and bilingual education* (pp. 32-53). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Parker, K. (2015, September 4). Donald Trump's tower of babble. *The Washington Post*.

  Washingtonpost.com. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/trumps-tower-of-babble/2015/09/04/b21d060a-5345-11e5-9812-92d5948a40f8\_story.html?noredirect=on&utm\_term=.ada781a073c3.
- Pew Research Center. (2012). Q. Your surveys often show results based on "non-Hispanic whites" and "non-Hispanic blacks". Why aren't Hispanics counted in these categories?

  Classifying race and ethnicity. Retrieved from

  http://www.pewresearch.org/2012/04/16/classifying-race-and-ethnicity/
- Reynolds, G.F. (1953, January). Where the heart is. *Colorado Library Association Bulletin*, No. 33, p. 3-12.
- Rogers, G.J. (1976). Spanish and Mexican influences. In E. Echeverria and J. Otero (Eds.),

  \*Hispanic Colorado. Four centuries: History and Heritage.\* Fort Collins, CO: Centennial Publications.
- Romano, A. (2014, March 27). More Weld County children living in poverty. *The Tribune*.

  Retrieved from http://www.greeleytribune.com/news/local/more-weld-county-children-living-in-poverty/.

- Rosales. R. (2016, April 15). ¿Cómo puedo ayudarle? Providing the best service to your Hispanic community. Magazine Feature. *Public Libraries Online*. Retrieved from http://publiclibrariesonline.org/2016/04/como-puedo-ayudarle-providing-the-best-service-to-your-hispanic-community/
- Rosenblum, M.R., Kandel, W.A., Seelke, C.R. and Wassem, R.E. (2012, July 7). Mexican migration to the United States: Policy and trends. CRS Report for Congress.

  Congressional research Service. Retrieved from http://fas.org/sgp/crs/row/R42560.pdf
- Rothman, J. (2008). Linguistic epistemology and the notion of monolingualism. Sociolinguistic Studies, 2 (3), 441-457. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/ 250015164\_Linguistic\_epistemology\_and\_the\_notion\_of\_monolingualism
- RUPRI. (2006). Demographic and economic profile: Colorado. Updated December 2006. Rural Policy Research Institute. Retrieved from http://www.rupri.org/Forms/Colorado.pdf
- Ryan, C. (2013). Language use in the United States: 2011. American Community Survey

  Reports. United States Census Bureau. Retrieved from

  http://www.census.gov/prod/2013pubs/acs-22.pdf.
- San Luis Preservation. (2007, February 17). Don Dario Gallegos. Retrieved from http://www.sanluispreservation.com/
- Sarling, J. H. and Van Tassel, D. S. (1999). Community analysis: Research that matters to a North-Central Denver community. *Library and Information Science Research*, 21(1), pp. 7-29. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1016/S0740-8188(99)80003-6.
- Seargeant, P. (2009). Language ideology, language theory and the regulation of linguistic behavior. *Language Sciences*, *31*(4), pp. 345-359. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.langsci.2007.12.002

- Seattle Office for Civil Rights. (2009/ Rev.2012). Inclusive outreach and public engagement guide. Race and Social Justice Initiative. Retrieved from <a href="http://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/RSJI/GRE/IOPEguide01-11-12.pdf">http://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/RSJI/GRE/IOPEguide01-11-12.pdf</a>
- Schmidt, S. (2017, February 28). Suspect in Kansas bar shooting of Indians apparently thought they were Iranians. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2017/02/28/suspect-in-kansas-bar-shooting-of-indians-apparently-thought-they-were-iranians/?utm\_term=.1a8b16fa2c6c.
- Serving Spanish-Speaking Communities Tally Sheet (2007). Adapted from Serving Spanish-speaking communities checklist.
- Siebens, J. and Julian, T. (2011). Native North American languages spoken at home in the
  United States and in Puerto Rico: 2006-2010. American Community Survey Briefs.
  United States Census Bureau. Retrieved from
  https://www.census.gov/prod/2011pubs/acsbr10-10.pdf
- Sonnie, A. (2017). Advancing racial equity in public libraries. Local and Regional Government Alliance of Racial Equity. Retrieved from https://www.racialequityalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/GARE\_LibrariesReport\_v8\_DigitalScroll\_WithHyperlinks.pdf
- Southern Colorado Guide. (n.d.). Colorado's oldest church. Retrieved from http://www.southern-colorado-guide.com/colorados-oldest-church.html
- SPELL. (2016). From home visits to library visits: how High Plains Library District is supporting parents in early literacy. Retrieved from http://spellproject.weebly.com/uploads/1/5/3/3/15331602/hpldlegal.pdf

- Staff Report. (2014, May 5). Census: Weld County falls to No. 9 in U.S. for total ag sales;

  Colorado reaches top 10 in livestock. *The Fence Post*. Retrieved from

  http://www.thefencepost.com/news/census-weld-county-falls-to-no-9-in-u-s-for-total-ag-sales-colorado-reaches-top-10-in-livestock/
- Statistical Atlas (2015). Language by place in Costilla County. Languages in Costilla County,

  Colorado. Statistical Atlas. Cedar Lake Ventures, Inc. Retrieved from

  https://statisticalatlas.com/county/Colorado/Costilla-County/Languages
- Statistical Atlas (2015). Language by place in Weld County. Languages in Weld County,

  Colorado. Statistical Atlas. Cedar Lake Ventures, Inc. Retrieved from

  https://statisticalatlas.com/county/Colorado/Weld-County/Languages
- Sterbenz, C. (2014, January 6). Here's what all 50 state names actually mean. *Business Insider*. Retrieved from http://www.businessinsider.com/state-name-meanings-2014-1.
- Sullivan, S. (2015, September 3). Jeb Bush responds to Trump: 'Ridiculous' to say only speak English. *The Washington Post*. Washingtonpost.com. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/post-politics/wp/2015/09/03/jeb-bush-responds-to-trump-ridiculous-to-say-only-speak-english/?utm\_term=.eef75bddc409
- Swan, D.W., Grimes, J. and Owens, T. (2013, September). The State of small and rural libraries in the U.S. Research Brief No.5. Institute of Museum and Library Services. Retrieved from https://www.imls.gov/assets/1/AssetManager/Brief2013\_05.pdf
- Taylor, R. (1976). Cuerno Verde (Greenhorn) Colorado. In E. Echeverria and J. Otero (Eds.),
  Hispanic Colorado. Four centuries: History and Heritage. Fort Collins, CO: Centennial
  Publications.

- The Greeley Tribune. (1934, March 30). Spanish-American books are wanted by County Library. *The Greeley Tribune*. p.1.
- The Greeley Tribune. (1935, June 5). Work by House of Neighborly Service is told. *The Greeley Tribune*. p.3.
- The Greeley Tribune. (1935, December 2). New board members of House of Neighborly Services are honored with dinner Monday. *The Greeley Tribune*. p.4.
- The Greeley Tribune. (1946, March 6). Young boys of Lincoln School are guests of HNS. *The Greeley Tribune*. p.7.
- The Leadership Conference. (2012, August 3). Experts Say American Community Survey Is Key to a Successful 2020 Census. The Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights & The Leadership Conference Education Fund. CivilRights.org. Retrieved from https://civilrights.org/experts-say-american-community-survey-is-key-to-a-successful-2020-census/
- TomManasota. (2015, September 18). Re: What Sarah Palin's 'Speak American' is all about [Comment]. CNN. Cable News Network. Retrieved from https://www.cnn.com/2015/09/06/opinions/mcwhorter-palin-speak-american/index.html
- UC Davis. (2016, October). H-2A, H-2B, braceros. *Rural Migrations News*, 22 (4). Migration UC Davis. Retrieved from http://migration.ucdavis.edu/rmn/more.php?id=2002
- UC Davis. (2016, October). NAWS: V-shape trends. *Rural Migration News*, 22 (4). Migration UC Davis. Retrieved from http://migration.ucdavis.edu/rmn/more.php?id=1999
- UC Davis. (2013, October). Meat and migrants. *Rural Migration News*, *19*(4). Migration UC Davis. Retrieved from https://migration.ucdavis.edu/rmn/more.php?id=1778.

- Urban Libraries Council. (2007). Making cities stronger: Public library contributions to local economic development. The Urban Institute. Retrieved from http://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/46006/1001075-Making-Cities-Stronger.PDF.
- USCIS and IMLS. (2010). Library services for immigrants: A report on current practices. Office of Citizenship. Retrieved from https://www.uscis.gov/sites/default/files/USCIS/Office%20of%20Citizenship/Citizenship %20Resource%20Center%20Site/Publications/G-1112.pdf
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2016). Language spoken at home. 2016: ACS 1-year estimates. Retrieved from https://data.census.gov/cedsci/results/all?q=spanish%20speakers%20in%20colorado&g= 0400000US08&ps=banner\*show@false
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2016). Language spoken at home. 2012-2016 American Community Survey 5- year Estimates. Retrieved from https://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices/jsf/pages/productview.xhtml?src=CF
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2016). Quick facts: Costilla County, Colorado. United States Census Bureau. Retrieved from 
  https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/costillacountycolorado/PST045216
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2016). Quick facts: Weld County, Colorado. United States Census Bureau.
  Retrieved from
  - https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/weldcountycolorado/PST045216
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2015). Number of languages spoken in the fifteen largest metro areas.2009-2013 American Community Survey. Retrieved from

- https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/newsroom/releases/2015/cb15-185\_graphic.pdf
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2012, May 22). Census Bureau releases estimates of undercount and overcount in the 2010 Census. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.census.gov/newsroom/releases/archives/2010\_census/cb12-95.html">https://www.census.gov/newsroom/releases/archives/2010\_census/cb12-95.html</a>
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2010). Race and Hispanic or Latino: 2010 State -- County / County

  Equivalent 2010 Census Summary File 1 Retrieved from

  https://factfinder.census.gov/faces/nav/jsf/pages/community\_facts.xhtml
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2010). Table 7. Detailed languages spoken at home and ability to speak English for the population 5 years and over for Colorado: 2006-2008, in DETAILED LANGUAGE SPOKEN AT HOME AND ABILITY TO SPEAK ENGLISH FOR THE POPULATION 5 YEARS AND OLDER BY STATES: 2006-2008 (2010). Retrieved from https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2008/demo/2006-2008-lang-tables.html.
- U.S. Department of Agriculture. (2014). Table 7. Hired farm labor. 2012 Census Volume 1,
  Chapter 2: State Level Data. 2012 Census of Agriculture. USDA, National Agriculture
  Statistics Service. Retrieved from
  https://www.agcensus.usda.gov/Publications/2012/Full\_Report/
  Volume 1,\_Chapter\_2\_US\_State\_Level/
- U.S. Department of Labor. (2016). Findings from the National Agricultural Workers Survey
  (NAWS) 2013-2014: A Demographic and employment profile of United States
  farmworkers. Research Report No.12. Retrieved from U.S. Department of Labor
  Employment and Training Administration, Office of Policy Development and Research.

- https://www.doleta.gov/agworker/pdf/NAWS\_Research\_Report\_12\_Final\_508\_Complia nt.pdf
- U.S. Department of Labor. (n.d.). NAWS data limitations. United States Department of Labor.

  Retrieved from https://www.doleta.gov/naws/pages/overview/data-limitations.cfm
- Varheim, A. (2010). Gracious space: Library programming strategies towards immigrants as tools in the creation of social capital. *Library & Information Science Research*, *33*(1), 12-18. Retrieved from doi 10.1016/j.lisr.2010.04.005.
- Varheim, A., Steinmo, S., and Ide, E. (2008). Do libraries matter? Public libraries and the creation of social capital. *Journal of Documentation*, 64 (6) 877-892. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/00220410810912433.
- Wire, S.D. (2016, April 28). The 2010 census missed thousands of California's Latino children. Here's what could change in 2020. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from http://www.latimes.com/politics/la-pol-ca-census-undercounting-latinos-20160428-story.html
- Zabrodskaja, A. (2015). [The Multilingual Turn: Implications for SLA, TESOL and bilingual education, by S. May]. Sociolinguistic Studies, 9 (4), 493-498. Retrieved from DOI: 10.1558/sols.v9i4.27018.

#### **APPENDICES**

## Appendix A

### **Interview Questions (Library)**

- What do you define bilingual as in terms of library initiatives?
- How would you define Spanish-language initiatives as?
- In your opinion, what does the library or library district at which you work(ed) define as bilingual programs, services and collections in comparison to Spanish language programs, services and collections?
- In your opinion or experience, who (what department) sets the definitions at the district and branch level?
- Who does each level consider the main/ prioritized stakeholders to be in terms of the initiatives a library implements?
- Which stakeholders have the most power to influence those initiatives?
- Who leads the debate over the languages in which library services should be offered?
- How does the definition or concept vary from one library to the next?
- When you first began working for the library, were there already bilingual or Spanish-language initiatives in place?
- When you first began working for the library, was there already an established Spanish-language collection? What was it inclusive of (i.e., books, CD's, movies, references)?
- Are you aware of when the first Spanish-language collection, program, resource and/or service was implemented at the specific branch where you work? What do you know about the history of your branch's efforts?
- Are you aware of the initiatives within your overall library district? What do you know about the history of the district's overall efforts?
- Who/what/ when was the focus of the first initiatives? Why and how were they implemented?
- What happened/ how did they develop after that? Was there a gap in time before they developed? Were they maintained or abandoned?
- What were the first roadblocks/ obstacles to Spanish-language initiatives? (i.e., programs, collections, resources, service). How have the roadblocks/ obstacles evolved? How do the previous roadblocks compare with current roadblocks?
- What branches/ districts have maintained archived information on their specific initiatives?

- In your opinion, what factors have led to some branches to archive efforts and others not to?
- Was the first Spanish-language collections material for adults or children?
- Are you aware of how long your library has had a Spanish-language collection? Do you know when it began? If not, in your time at the library, how would you compare the Spanish-language collection from when you started, to its present state?
- At what point did the collections material expand to include other age groups (i.e., adults, young adults, or children)?
- During the time during which you've worked at the library, how have the collection, programs and services expanded?
- Is there a record within each individual library of the Spanish language collections as they developed? (What was the first book in Spanish? What were the first ten/ the first twenty in Spanish? Who were their intended readers?)
- Do you feel that the programs, services and collections that you are aware of began based on needs identified by the library, or communicated by Spanish Speaking communities/patrons?
- What role has the Latino/ Spanish Speaking community had in initiating the services historically? What role do they have currently?
- When were the outreach services initially begun? Did they include outreach services inclusive of Spanish-speaking patrons? Did initial efforts in individual districts begin at the district level or at individual branches?
- How much has the intervention efforts of state organizations such as Colorado Association of Libraries and Colorado REFORMA played in initiating, expanding, maintaining and further developing Spanish-language services?
- Do the staff at your branch belong to the Colorado REFORMA?
- How have the Spanish-speaking patrons the libraries serve changed over time?
- How would you evaluate the libraries current initiatives? What are they inclusive of?
- What do you envision for future Spanish-language initiatives?

#### Appendix B

#### **Interview Questions (REFORMA)**

- What do you define as bilingual and/or Spanish language initiatives in the Public Library system? Is there a distinction between the two made by the library? Does the library's distinction (or lack of) agree with the distinction (or lack of) set by REFORMA?
- Who does each—the branch, district, and state libraries—prioritize in terms of stakeholders when deciding on services or programs to implement for Hispanic communities? How much does the Board of Directors as stakeholders become a priority over patrons and communities (more specifically, Hispanic/ Latino communities)?
- How have the different stakeholders conflicted with the librarians' and Colorado REFORMA's efforts to provide bilingual/ Spanish language services over time?
- As a key person in establishing the Colorado REFORMA chapter, what would you say was the initial goal of REFORMA (resources, collections, cultural programs, services, staffing/ professional development, or collections)?
- In addition to your work with REFORMA in conjunction with the Colorado Public Libraries, what has been your relationship with the Library (have you also worked directly for a Public Library in Colorado)? Did you work more specifically with a branch or district?
- What was your initial vision for the public libraries in Colorado at the time? How has it changed (or not)?
- When you first became involved in developing bilingual/ Spanish-language initiatives, what were some of the principal challenges?
- How did the challenges evolve over time?
- What were the main challenges in getting the more rural libraries on board? (what was their response to the bibliographies distributed at regional conferences?)
- How did the lack of Latino staff and librarians in Colorado Public Libraries impact REFORMA's initial efforts? Were any of those issues resolved, and if so, how? Was professional development (inter/ multi-cultural competency) for non-Latino staff one of REFORMA's principal goals when they first began implementing bilingual/ Spanish-language programs for surrounding Hispanic communities?
- How has the lack of Latino staff continued to impact the efforts over time?
- Considering that the Public Library is easily seen as a branch of the government, as well as a white middle-class institution, leading many immigrants to distrust it—what efforts were initially made to build up trust in Hispanic communities and among Hispanic immigrants?

- Would you say more effort still needs to be made to maintain this trust, particularly under the president-elect, in attracting immigrants who either are themselves undocumented, or have undocumented family members?
- What have Colorado REFORMA's main achievements and continued goals been regarding Colorado Public Libraries?
- Do you feel that the bilingual/ Spanish-language programs, services and collections began based on needs identifies by the public library, or needs highlighted by leaders within Hispanic communities?
- What role have Latino community leaders had in the library's implementation of services?
- Has the library or Colorado REFORMA attempted to involve community leaders in maintaining awareness of changing needs, or of the effectiveness of the services?
- In your experience, at what point did services to Spanish speaking or Latino patrons evolve from assimilation-oriented efforts to valuing bi- and multi-lingual/ cultural patrons and communities?
- How would you evaluate the current bilingual/ Spanish-language services? Do many still incorporate assimilation-oriented efforts, or do they strive more for multi-cultural competency among library staff?
- Do you see REFORMA's efforts in terms of the value (socio-political and cultural, as well as the act of meeting patrons' needs) of offering bilingual/ Spanish language services as a model for other languages spoken in increasing numbers in Colorado?
- If so, how many people within a community should be considered as a motivation for that effort to be made to implement services?

# Appendix C

Table 2

Overview of Findings

Era	Year	Initiative
Early	1933	• Library included in plans for the House of Neighborly Services (HNS), call for book donations.
Initiatives	1935	• HNS reported serving beyond 11,000 people over a 7-month period; services were inclusive of a circulating library (p.3).
	1946	Last mention of library run by HNS.
	1979	<ul> <li>GPL and WLD surveyed Spanish-surnamed in Greeley and Evans to identify registered borrowers.</li> </ul>
2001-2005	2001	<ul> <li>Outreach began; focus on needs of Hispanic families surrounding Lincoln Park Branch; bilingual reference librarian hired.</li> </ul>
	2002-2005	<ul> <li>Gates Lab at Lincoln Park Branch; collaboration with CBOCES and Head Start begins; bilingual bookbags and storytime offered; outreach joined REFORMA.</li> </ul>
	2003	<ul> <li>Rotating Spanish-language collection; Feria Internacional del Libro in Guadalajara; Galletita y Cuentos.</li> </ul>
	2004	<ul> <li>Lincoln Park Branch library renovated, bilingual signage hung; bilingual presentations and tours of library; new bilingual reference librarian hired.</li> </ul>
2006-2009	2005-2007	• "Every Child Ready to Read"/ "Weld County Reads", inclusive of bilingual programs and trainings for parents and staff; distribution of bilingual versions of Rodolfo Anaya's "Bless Me, Ultima"; computer classes in Spanish offered.
	2006-2007	<ul> <li>Latino Services Work Team; attendance survey of bilingual/ bicultural programs.</li> <li>Farr Regional Library features <i>Calle 54</i>; WLD presents <i>White Gold Laborers: The Story of</i></li> </ul>
	2007	Greeley's Spanish Colony
		HipHop Madness, signature program aimed at Latino youth; first "The American Dream Starts"
	2008	at Your Library" grant, used to circulate Adult Literacy tubs at Head Start; WLD renamed HPLD; interface of online catalog translated;
		• District website translated; "Mi Guía"—library guide for adult literacy material translated to
	2009	Spanish; push to include Spanish-language books on bookmobile.

Era	Year	Initiative
2010-2015	2010-2015	<ul> <li>Hired an additional bilingual and bicultural outreach staff; citizenship classes offered; Winter Reading Program promoted to Spanish-speaking adults; hosted Colorado REFORMA and Voices of the Americas (immigrants and refugees sharing stories); computer classes in Spanish; translation team formed; radio spots on "El Tigre" to announce HPLD services and programming; GED classes in Spanish.</li> </ul>
	2010	<ul> <li>Kress Cinema aired Mexico vs. France World Cup game.</li> </ul>
	2014-2016	• SPELL (Supporting Parents through Early Literacy with Libraries), partnered with HIPPY and inclusive of 1000 books before kindergarten: early literacy tip cards in Spanish, library tours and bilingual family storytime.
Ongoing,	2016	Spanish-language version of website, "Mi Biblioteca," terminated.
Recent or Current	2016-present	• Spanish-language computer classes continued; programming on health, job searches, ethnic cooking, and 'intercambio'.
	2017	People and Stories/ Gente y Cuentos: critical literacy in Spanish
	2017	Literacy fair with Immigrants' Resource Center
	2016/2017- present	• PASO: for Latina women, with materials and curriculum in Spanish, to support mothers and home daycare workers knowledge of early childhood development and literacy; accompanying bilingual book bags offered by the library.
	Proposed	<ul> <li>Plaza Comunitaria (Spanish literacy program sponsored by Mexican Consulate); bilingual support for first generation students and parents throughout the college application process; increased representation of Greeley's Latino communities at libraries.</li> </ul>

Era	Year	Initiative
Collections	1914-1927	Spanish-language literature donated to Greeley Public Library.
	1934-1935	<ul> <li>Call for "Spanish American books" for HNS; books donated by the Weld County Library.</li> </ul>
	2003	WLD invited to participate in rotating Spanish-language collection
	2004	• Collection staff and outreach sent to the Feria Internacional del Libro in Guadalajara; yearly
	(ongoing)	budget increases for bilingual and Spanish-language material
	2017	<ul> <li>Inter-shelving bilingual and Spanish-language board books at Farr Regional</li> </ul>
	Current	• Spanish-language collections maintained by Ault, Eaton, Platteville, Johnstown and Fort Lupton.
Staff	2001	• First outreach staff hired to serve Spanish-speaking communities; bilingual reference librarian hired
	2004	New bilingual reference librarian hired for renovated Lincoln Park Branch
	2009	Additional bilingual/ bicultural outreach staff hired
	2013	Generalist movement begins, bilingualism downplayed in recruitment
	2015-present	Spanish classes offered to staff
	2017	<ul> <li>More bilingual/ bicultural staff hired for branch libraries</li> </ul>
Translations	Early 2000's	<ul> <li>Outreach completed translations: promotional material for computer labs; Summer Reading flyers and program calendar; service brochures and programming flyers; "contraband" translations by bilingual branch librarians</li> </ul>
	2009-present	• Translation team (limited) composed of outreach and bilingual branch staff; early literacy tip cards for SPELL; nursery rhyme book; guides to Dewey Decimal systems; general service brochures and guides; guides to create personalized reading lists for adults and children
	2016-present	Summer Reading Program poster and calendar
	2016-present	<ul> <li>Loss of "Mi Biblioteca"/ Spanish version of library website (Spanish version of catalog interface kept).</li> </ul>

Funding	<ul> <li>Limited federal funding</li> <li>Grants are time-limited, based on sustainability of programs (LSTA grants)</li> <li>Grants that limit language in which literacy and other services can be offered</li> </ul>
Public Information Office and Library Infrastructure	<ul> <li>Decision-making processes as reflective of underlying attitudes</li> <li>Approval by PIO for Spanish-language programming (community engagement office)</li> <li>Oversight of displays, arrangements, bookends and decoration at branch libraries</li> <li>Marketing perspective vs. service professions perspective (\$1.00/ person vs. building relationship and trust)</li> <li>Attitudes toward low-literacy in other languages</li> <li>Lack of personal investment in Hispanic communities to serve</li> <li>Outreach as independent of branch libraries (not fully collaborative)</li> </ul>
Trust and Representation	<ul> <li>Surrounding political climate and attitudes toward bi- and multilingualism</li> <li>Library card application process</li> <li>Social capital of communities served (political, linguistic, cultural and racial barriers)</li> <li>Location of Spanish-language collections/ inter-shelving of bilingual books</li> <li>Lack of linguistic and cultural representation among administration and staff</li> <li>Community analyses and mapping collections</li> </ul>